

Impact of Structural Adjustment Policies An Assessment Using Participatory Techniques

Volume II: Main Report

**Atiur Rahman
M M Shafiqur Rahman
Abul Quashem
Zulfiqar Ali
Arifur Rahman**

September 2000

Structural Adjustment Participatory Review Initiative (SAPRI)

Preface

The main report presents the major findings of the participatory study on the impact of SAP. These findings have been drawn from the three sectors: agriculture, trade and industry, and interest rate liberalization. A number of qualitative techniques have been applied to catch the voices of the major primary stakeholders involved in each of the above three sectors. Although many of the findings are not conclusive, however, they indicate the kind of social impact which has been unleashed by SAP.

I am grateful to all my fellow researchers (M M Shafiqur Rahman for investigating agriculture; Zulfiqar Ali for trade and industry; and Abul Quashem and Arifur Rahman for financial sector) for sharing the pains and pleasures of this non-conventional study. Volume iii containing statistical appendices related to agriculture has been prepared by M. M. Shafiqur Rahman. I am also grateful to Waliul Islam, Shahidul Alam, Monira Hoque, Pallab Mojumder, Nafisa Halim, and Ashabul Huq for providing all types of research and computer support. Thanks also go to Gourango Nandi for his support in organizing the meetings and workshops in Khulna. Finally, we are indebted to all the participants of qualitative sessions for sharing their views on the impact of SAP with us.

While thanks go to all the contributors for their support, the study team takes the full and sole responsibility of any errors and omissions. The team also assumes full responsibility for the opinions expressed in the Report.

Atiur Rahman
Senior Research Fellow, BIDS
&
Team Leader
Participatory Component, SAPRI

STUDY TEAM

Dr. Atiur Rahman Senior Research Fellow Bangladesh Institute of Development Studies	Team Leader
M. M. Shafiqur Rahman	Independent Consultant, Agriculture Component
Abul Quashem	Consultant, Financial Sector
Dr. Zulfiqar Ali Research Associate Bangladesh Institute of Development Studies	Consultant, Trade and Industry
Arifur Rahman	Junior Consultant, Financial Sector
Md. Waliul Islam	Project Manager
Pallab Mazumdar Monira Haque Nafisa Halim F. M. Shahidul Alam	Research Officer Research Officer Research Officer Research Officer
Mr. Md. Monowar Hossain Mr. Hafizur Rahman Mr. Abdur Razzak Mr. Moniruzzaman Mr. Md. Yahiya Mr. M.M. Alam Mr. Afzalul Haque Mr. Aminul Islam Aslam Parvez	Field Officer Field Officer Field Officer Field Officer Field Officer Field Officer Field Officer Field Officer Field Officer
Ashabul Hoque	Computer Operator

Table of Contents

Title	Page
Summary Report: Volume I	
<i>Preface</i>	<i>i</i>
<i>Study Team</i>	<i>ii</i>
<i>Table of Contents</i>	<i>iii</i>
<i>List of Exhibits</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>List of Boxes</i>	<i>vi</i>
<i>List of Charts (Financial sector)</i>	<i>vii</i>
<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>vii</i>
<i>Acronyms and Glossaries</i>	<i>viii</i>
1. Introduction	1
2. Objectives	1
3. Methodology and Limitations	2
3.1 Trade and Industry	2
3.2 Financial Sector	14
3.3 Agriculture	16
4. Impact Assessment: Trade and Industry	38
4.1 Introduction	38
4.2 Trade Policy Reform and Privatization in Bangladesh: An Overview	39
4.3 Impact Assessment: Trade Liberalization	40
4.4 Impact Assessment: Privatization of Jute Manufacturing Industries	47
5. Impact Assessment: Financial Sector	52
5.1 Some Stakeholders Speak	52
5.2 Background	53
5.3 Study Results	55
5.4 Findings from Secondary Sources of Data	65
5.5 Debate on High-Low Interest Rate After the Liberalization	71
5.6 A Summing Up of Banking Issues in Bangladesh	71
5.7 A Lesson from FSR in Bangladesh	74
6. Impact Assessment: Agriculture	79
A : The Context	79
6.1 Introduction and Background	79
6.2 The Bangladesh Agriculture in Context: A Brief Survey of Critical Issues	82
6.3 The Profile of the Study Locations	95

Title	Page
B: Intermediate Outcomes of SAP-Led Measures	102
6.4 Mechanized Irrigation	102
6.5 Chemical Fertilizer	136
6.6 Pesticides	162
6.7 Rural Finance from Public Sector Lending Institutions	165
6.8 Public Domestic Procurement	178
C: Long-Term Outcomes of SAP-Led Measures	185
6.9 Participatory Poverty Assessment	185
6.10 The Markets: Labour, Land and Indigenous Credit	206
6.11 Inequality: Polarity between Land-poor and Land-rich Households	230
6.12 Food Security	241
6.13 Gender Equity	246
6.14 The Environment	252
6.15 Corruption	259
6.16 Social Capital	262
D: Stakeholder Perspectives on SAP-Led Measures and Other Related Issues	264
6.17 Stakeholder Perspectives: At the Institution Level	264
6.18 Stakeholder Perspectives: At the Community Level	277
7. Conclusions and Recommendation	323
7.1 Trade and Industry	323
7.2 Financial Sector	328
7.3 Agriculture	331
References	347
Appendices (Agriculture): Volume III	

List of Exhibits

Title	Page
Exhibit 3.3.1 : Major SAP-led Measures with Regard to Irrigation Equipment in Bangladesh	33
Exhibit 3.3.2 : Major SAP-led Measures with Regard to Chemical Fertilizer	34
Exhibit 3.3.3 : Command Area Continuum (Based on Time, Ownership and Operation)	35
Exhibit 3.3.4 : Triangulation of Participatory Investigation: Five Dimensions	36
Exhibit 3.3.5 : Data Gathering Scheme for Participatory Investigation	37
Exhibit 5.1 : A Schematic Diagram Showing the Skein of Banking Problems in Bangladesh	72
Exhibit 6.2.1 : Trend Rate of Growth of Rice Production for High Performer Districts During Four Ten-year Overlapping Periods Since the End Sixties	92
Exhibit 6.2.2 : Potential and Existing Yield of Major Crops in Bangladesh, 1994	93
Exhibit 6.2.3 : Taxonomy of Unsustainability	94
Exhibit 6.9.1 : Trend in well-being of Rural Households in Study Villages over Last 10-12 Years (Participatory Poverty Assessment by well-being Ranking) Period of Assessment: March 2000	202
Exhibit 6.9.2 : Graphical Representation of Poverty Dynamics in Study Villages (A. Sailgun (SW), Joypurhat [Irrigation coverage: highest])	203
Exhibit 6.9.3 : Graphical Representation of Poverty Dynamics in Study Villages (B. Dehergati (M), Barisal, [Irrigation coverage: medium])	204
Exhibit 6.9.4 : Graphical Representation of Poverty Dynamics in Study Villages (B. Dehergati (E), Barisal, [Irrigation coverage: lowest])	205
Exhibit 6.10.1 : Seasonal Variations in Wage Employment, Wage Rate and Coarse Rice Price in Study Village Over Last 10-12 Years	226
Exhibit 6.10.2 : Diagrammatic Presentation of Wage Employment and Wage Rate in Crop Sector in Study Village Over Last 10-12 Years (A. Village: Sailgun (SW), Joypurhat)	227
Exhibit 6.10.3 : Diagrammatic Presentation of Impact of SAP-led Measures on Demand for Agricultural Labourers in Study Area (Intensively irrigated village)	228
Exhibit 6.10.4 : Impact of Mechanized Irrigation on Labour Demand in Study Area (Intensively irrigated village)	229
Exhibit 6.11.1 : Landholding Distribution in Study Villages Over Last 10-12 Years (A. Village: Sailgun (SW), Joypurhat)	237
Exhibit 6.11.2 : Landholding Distribution in Study Villages Over Last 10-12 Years (B. Village: Dehergati (M), Barisal)	238
Exhibit 6.11.3 : Causality between Bank Credit, Green Revolution and Social	239
Exhibit 6.11.4 : Prosperity Line of Hazi Ishaq Ali	240
Exhibit 6.14.1 : Systems of the Environmental	258

List of Boxes

Title	Page
Box.3.3.1 : Methodological Diversity and Integration	28
Box.3.3.2 : How Case Studies can be Generalized to Theory	29
Box.3.3.3 : Building Blocks of the Conceptual Framework for Understanding the Sustainable Growth of the Bangladesh Agriculture	30
Box 3.3.4 : Criteria for Establishing the Trustworthiness of Participatory Process	31
Box 3.3.5 : Principles of Participatory Learning and Action	32
Box 4.1 : Impact of Trade Liberalization: Voices of the People	45
Box 4.2 : Impact of Trade Liberalization: Voices of the People	46
Box 4.3 : Impact of Trade Liberalization: Voices of the People	46
Box 4.4 : Impact of Trade Liberalization: Voices of the People	47
Box 4.5 : Impact of Privatization of Jute Mills: Voices of the People	51
Box 4.6 : Impact of Privatization of Jute Mills: Voices of the People	51
Box 5.1 : Shamsuddin Speaks against one NCB at Kalai in Joypurhat District	64
Box 5.2 : Accounting recycle of financial resources is a mechanism for increasing indebtedness of the borrowers	65
Box 5.3 : Bangladesh Bank's credit data do not reflect the reality	66
Box 5.4 : Essence of the Banking Reform Committee (BRC)	73
Box-5.5 : A lesson from Bangladesh's experience with interest rate liberalization	74
Box 6.1.1 : Three Types of Agriculture Summarized	81
Box 6.4.1 : Adulterated Fuel and Lubricant are Crippling Irrigation Equipment	131
Box 6.4.2 : Md. Ekramul is another victim of substandard STW	132
Box 6.4.3 : Ruhul Amin is a victim of substandard STW	133
Box 6.4.4 : An Emerging Rental Market for LLPs in Barisal District	134
Box 6.4.5 : Why Has the Barisal Irrigation Project (BIP) Failed?	135
Box 6.7.1 : Poverty, Indebtedness and Corruption: An Innovation in Corrupt Practices in Rural Banking	177
Box 6.9.1 : Participatory Poverty Assessment: What it is	198
Box 6.9.2 : Steps in well-being Ranking of Households at Community Level	199
Box 6.9.3 : Participatory well-being Measures	200
Box 7.3.1 : Decisions on Hypotheses (Ag.)	339
Box 7.3.2 : Matrix of Recommendations (Ag.)	342
Box 7.3.3 : Excerpts from the Caring for the Future, Report of the Independent Commission on Population and Quality of Life (Ag.)	346

List of Charts

Title	Page
Chart 5.1 : Trend of Credit-Deposit Ratio	67
Chart 5.2 : Trend of Nominal and Real Spread	67
Chart 5.3 : Trend of Deposit and Loan Rates	68
Chart 5.4 : Growth of Real Deposit and Real Advances	68
Chart 5.5 : Deposit and Advances as % of GDP	69
Chart 5.6 : Growth of Rural and Urban Deposits	69
Chart 5.7 : Share of Private Bank Branches	70

List of Tables

Title	Page
Table 3.1.1 : Participatory Investigation: Trade and Industry Methods, Instruments, Type of Participants and Data	4
Table 3.1.2 : Participatory Investigation: Trade and Industry Participants and Places of PRA/FGD Sessions and Interviews	6
Table 3.1.3 : Participatory Investigation: Trade and Industry Participants and Places of PRA/FGD Sessions and Interviews Triangulation in Data Collection Procedures	7
Table 3.1.4 : Participatory Investigation: Trade and Industry Specifying Hypotheses and Selecting Variables	11
Table 5.1 : Growth of Deposit, Advances and Share of Industrial Credit	75
Table 5.2 : Shares of Private, Public and Foreign Banks in Deposit, Advances and Branches	75
Table 5.3 : Interest Rate Structure in Bangladesh	76
Table 5.4 : Regional Shares in Bank Loans	76
Table 5.5 : Regional Shares of Deposits (percent)	76
Table 5.6 : Shares in advance accounts (percent)	77
Table 5.7 : Region-wise Credit-Deposit Ratios (percent)	77
Table 5.8 : Adversely Classified Loans (percent of total loans)	77
Table 5.9 : Actual Loan Loss Provision (percent of required provision)	77
Table 5.10 : Actual Capital (percent of capital as required by norms)	78
Table 5.11 : Number of Bank Branches (end June)	78
Table 7.1.1: Summary of Field Findings & the Voice of the People (Trade & Industry)	323

ACRONYMS AND GLOSSARY

1	AGBs	Agricultural Banks
2	<i>aman</i>	Group of rice varieties grown in the monsoon season and harvested after the monsoon season
3	ASA	Association for Social Advancement (a national NGO)
4	<i>aus</i>	Group of rice varieties sown in the pre-monsoon season and harvested after the monsoon season
5	BADC	Bangladesh Agricultural Development Corporation
6	BARD	Bangladesh Academy for Rural Development
7	BCIC	Bangladesh Chemical Industries Corporation
8	BFA	Bangladesh Fertilizer Association
9	<i>bigha</i>	A variable unit of land measurement. A standard bigha is one third of an acre
10	BKB	Bangladesh Krishi Bank
11	BRAC	Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee (a national NGO)
12	<i>boro</i>	Group of rice varieties grown in the dry season
13	BRDB	Bangladesh Rural Development Board
14	BWDB	Bangladesh Water Development Board
15	DAE	Directorate of Agricultural Extension
16	DoF	Department of Food
17	DTW	Deep tube-well
18	GB	Grameen Bank
19	GR	Green Revolution
20	ha	Hectare
21	HYV	High yielding variety
22	IIV	Intensively irrigated village
23	IRRI	International Rice Research Institute

24	<i>kharif</i>	Pre-monsoon and monsoon growing season
25	<i>khesari</i>	Winter legume grown for fodder and for grain (<i>Lathyrus sativus</i>)
26	LIV	Least irrigated village
27	LLP	Low lift pump
28	LSD	Local Supply Depot
29	MBIs	Member Based Institutions
30	MIV	Moderately irrigated village
31	Moushumi	A Local NGO
32	MP	Muriate of potash
33	<i>Mung</i>	Green gram (<i>Phaseolus mungo</i> var <i>aureus</i>)
34	NGO	Non-Government Organization
35	pH	(symbol used for acidity/alkalinity reaction)
36	PSI	Public sector institution
37	PROSHIKA	Proshikhana Shiksha ebong Kaaz (a national NGO)
38	<i>Rabi</i>	Dry (sunny) growing season, (including both the cool winter and hot pre-monsoon seasons)
39	RKUB	Rajshahi Krishi Unnayan Bank
40	SAP	Structural Adjustment Programmes/Policies
41	STW	Shallow tube-well
42	Tk.	Taka (Bangladeshi currency)
43	TSP	Triple superphosphate
44	Union	A Unit of local government administration below the upazila
45	<i>Upazila</i>	The lowest unit of government administration