SAPRI / GHANA

THE IMPACT OF SAP ON ACCESS TO AND QUALITY OF TERTIARY EDUCATION

DRAFT
APRIL 2001

CHAPTER ONE

BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY

1.1   Introduction

In order to reverse the deterioration in the economy since the 1970s and resume accelerated and sustainable growth in all sectors, Ghana launched a series of reform initiatives starting with the Economic Recovery Programme (ERP) in 1983 and the Structural Adjustment Programme (SAP) in 1986. The ERP and the SAP brought substantial increases in governmental and donor funding in some sectors of the economy.

It was expected that these programmes would, among other things, lead to an increase in access to and an improvement in the quality of education in Ghana. However, there are justifiable fears that access to education is becoming elusive to many people from low-income families and that the quality of education is progressively declining at all levels of the educational system. This situation makes it difficult for educational institutions to develop the type of human capital required for Ghana's socio-economic and political development

A good number of sector studies have been commissioned by external agencies, which have addressed or influenced policy decisions in the education sector. There are equally a good number of locally initiated studies, which have impacted on educational sector policy formulation. These studies, however, have paid very little attention to the tertiary education sector. The aim of the present study, initiated by SAPRI (a joint project of the government of Ghana, the World Bank, and a network of civil society organizations), is to examine the impact of SAP on access to and the quality of tertiary education in Ghana. The study contains a systematic review of relevant literature on the tertiary education sector and a survey of the views, concerns and recommendations of stakeholders of tertiary education, all against the backdrop of SAP.

1.2   Terms of Reference

The study was guided by the following terms of reference:

i) The review and annotation of existing literature on SAP and its impact on tertiary education in Ghana since 1983.

ii) The assessment of the impact of SAP on the access to and quality of education using the SAPRI-approved approaches. That is, participatory (community appraisal) and the gender approach.

iii) The determination of the existing inequities mainly in the tertiary education system.

iv) The determination of the extent of inequities with regard to gender, rural/urban, regional and socio-economic classes.

1.3 Objectives of the Study

The specific objectives of the study were to:

i) Identify tertiary education sector studies conducted in Ghana between 1983 and 1999;

ii) Identify the thematic areas addressed by the studies;

iii) Identify the commissioning and sponsoring authorities;

iv) Identify the major findings of the studies and establish their relevance to the topic under study;

v) Assess the coverage of gender equity at the tertiary level;

vi) Gain insight into the policy of access and quality assurance by the tertiary institutions;

vii) Examine the views of tertiary institution authorities, students and parents on funding and cost-recovery;

viii) Collect the views and concerns of stakeholders about the impact of SAP on tertiary education; and

ix) Give stakeholders the opportunity to make recommendations for sustainable tertiary education in Ghana.

1.4   Organization and Structure of the Study

The report is organized in 10 chapters.   Chapter one presents the terms of reference (TOR) and specific objectives of the study. Chapter two touches on the study methodology. Chapter three is an extensive review of literature on SAP and tertiary education in Ghana.   Specifically, the chapter starts with Ghana's education sector on the eve of SAP, goes on to the process of reforms in the education sector, continues with the World Bank and Ghana government's positions on tertiary education, and the civil society's reaction to and general critique of SAP.   This chapter ends with preliminary conclusions and recommendations drawn from the review.

Chapter four begins the presentation of the survey data from the various stakeholders.   This chapter presents the assessment and constraints of implementation of reforms in the various tertiary institutions.   Chapter five provides information on access to and quality of tertiary education in Ghana. Chapter six treats budgets and strategies of funding of tertiary education, and cost recovery modalities. Chapter seven focuses on human resource development by the tertiary institutions for themselves and for the country in the face of SAP. Chapter eight examines the relationship between development partners/NGOs and tertiary institutions.   Chapter nine then looks at the impact of SAP on tertiary education as seen by the various stakeholders. Finally, chapter ten presents the conclusions and recommendations of the study.

CHAPTER TWO

STUDY METHODOLOGY

2.1   Introduction

This study reviews existing literature on SAP and its impact on tertiary education and surveys the impact of SAP on tertiary education as stated or experienced by stakeholders. The stakeholders include:

i)   Policy-makers and implementers of SAP;

ii)   Tertiary institution authorities (Vice-Chancellors/Principals, Registrars, Finance Officers, Deans and Heads of Department);

iii)   Students of the tertiary institutions;

iv)   Development partners, World Bank/IMF resident representatives in Ghana;

v)   NGOs;

vi)   Parents/guardians of students of tertiary institutions; and

vii)   Community leaders.

2.2   Data Collection

2.2.1. Sources of Data

Three sources were used for the survey data collection: Interviews, focus group discussion (FGD) and official statistics/records from the tertiary institutions, the Ministry of Education, the National Council for Tertiary Education and the World Bank. The interviews and FGD were conducted in August 2000.

The literature review covers the period between 1983 and 1999. Although SAP began in 1986, it hads its roots in the ERP adopted in 1983. Furthermore, it has been argued that conditions in Ghana's education system had become very poor by the time the ERP was introduced. The year 1983 therefore serves as a benchmark for tracing the impact of ERP/SAP on education in Ghana.

2.2.2 Scope of the Study

In terms of scope, the review focuses on the tertiary education sector, but unavoidably some attention is given to the pre-tertiary education sectors since they serve as the preparatory ground for tertiary education.

2.3   Literature Coverage

This report is based on a review of 19 studies that have relevance to the subject under study. Compared with the pre-tertiary educational level, there is a dearth of studies on tertiary education, especially with reference to SAP.

Seventeen of the selected studies were initiated by five organizations, while twowere initiated by individuals. The organizations were: i) the Ministry of Education or its agencies such as the Ghana Education Service (GES); ii) the Ministry of Education with donor support; iii) development partners/donors; iv) research institutions; and v) non-governmental organizations (NGOs). Table 1 gives the distribution of the selected studies among the organizations and individuals.

Table 1:   Selected Studies by Initiators

INITIATOR	Number
Ministry of Education (MOE)	2
MOE with donor support	3
Development partners/donors	10
Research institutions	1
Non-governmental organizations (NGOs)	1
Individuals	2
TOTAL	**19**

As illustrated in Table 1, 10 of the 19 reviewed studies were initiated and funded by development partners. This confirms the conventional wisdom that development partners dominate the initiation and funding of research in the education sector (Samoff, J. et al., 1996; Agyeman et al., 2000).

2.4   Survey Coverage

To obtain as wide a representation of the stakeholders as possible, a variety of procedures were adopted to generate a sample for the study. The first step was to identify all institutions/organisations that have something to do with tertiary education in the country. These were:

1) All public universities (in Accra, Kumasi, Cape Coast, Tamale and
 Winneba);
2) All polytechnics located in university towns;
3) Takoradi Polytechnic (as a substitute for a Winneba-based polytechnic);
4) The Ministry of Education (MOE)
5) The National Council for Tertiary Education (NCTE)
6) World Bank/IMF and development partners; and
7) NGOs.

In step two, individual respondents representing the identified institutions/ organisations were then targeted for interviews:
1) Authorities of the tertiary institutions (i.e. Vice-Chancellors/Principals,
 Registrars, Deans of Faculties and Heads of Department);
2) Representatives of the Students Representative Council (SRC)/Junior
Common Room Committees (JCRC) from each of the institutions;
3) Representatives of development partners (all located in Accra);
4) Officials of MOE and NCTE.

2.5 Focus Group Discussion

For each university/polytechnic town, a FGD was held covering parents, opinion leaders (including religious leaders) and Assembly members. The FGD participants were of varied ages, educational background and occupation, as well as fairly balanced with regard to sex. An important criterion for participation in the discussion was that the participant should have at least one child attending school or be himself/herself a student.

The following categories of participants were targeted for the FGD session in each of the study sites:

--	Parents (2 males, 2 females)	4
--	Religious organizations (Catholic, Protestant, Pentecostal, Muslim)	4
--	Opinion leaders (1 male, 1 female)	2
--	District Assembly men/women	1
--	Tertiary level student	1
	Total	12

2.6   Respondents/Participants (Sample)

Our sample from the interviews and the FGDs amounted to 96 respondents and 64 participants respectively. Tables 2 and 3 give details of the composition of the survey respondents and the FGD participants.

Table 2: Profile of Survey Respondents

Institution/Organisation	Category of Respondent	Number	Total
University	Vice-Chancellor	1	
	Registrar	6	
	Dean	7	
	Head of Department	10	24
Polytechnic	Principal	5	
	Registrar	2	
	Dean	6	
	Head of Department	23	36
Government representative	Chief Director	2	2
Development partner	FAWE (Co-coordinator), AAU (PRO), UNESCO, ADB, GTZ (Assistant Manager of Education), French Embassy (Education Attaché)	6	*6
Student Representative	University	17	
	Polytechnic	11	28
Total			**96**

* one representative each from six organisations

Table 3: Profile of FGD Participants

Category	No.	S e x		E d u c a t i o n L e v e l				Ward Attending School		
		M	F	Basic	SSS/Sec	Post – Sec	Tert	Basic	SSS	Tert
Parent	16	7	9	3	7	4	2	2	3	11
Religious leader a) Christian	6	6	-	-	3	1	2	2	3	1
b) Muslim	2	2	-	-	1	1	-	2	-	-
Opinion leader	20	12	8	1	6	3	10	4	6	10
District Assembly member	12	9	3	1	5	4	2	4	5	3
Student	8	5	3	-	-	-	8	-	-	-
Total	**64**	**41**	**23**	**5**	**22**	**13**	**24**	**14**	**17**	**25**

In this report, the individuals of the survey will be referred to as respondents, whiles the people in the FGD will be referred to as participants.

2.7   Limitations of the Literature Review and Survey

The data collection process had the following limitations: Many of the representatives of the development partners were reluctant to provide information on SAP. Notable among them were the World Bank and Norwegian Embassy.

It was also very difficult tracking the authorities of tertiary institutions because the exercise took place at a time when all the universities were on recess. The polytechnics were also on strike. Some respondents were even reluctant to send their minds back to days before the introduction of SAP in Ghana.

Some institutions like the University of Development Studies (UDS) and the polytechnics, which have recently established tertiary programmes, were unable to provide comparative information on pre-and post-SAP periods because they

were not in existence before the introduction of SAP. Official statistics on budget allocations were difficult to obtain, especially from many of the authorities of tertiary institutions, because of the poor record-keeping culture in the country.

CHAPTER THREE

LITERATURE REVIEW

3.1   Ghana's Education on the Eve of SAP

3.1.1. Introduction

The educational reform initiated in Ghana in 1987 has gained support and recognition in some international quarters for being comprehensive and well conceived. Within Ghana, the reform has been a central focus of public concern and debate. It stands out as a unique event in the evolution of education in Ghana because it integrates older policies and concerns with new thinking and philosophies, leading to the formulation of a comprehensive policy.

3.1.2. The State of Education before the Reforms

Ghana's education system, which was in near collapse in the 1980s, was viewed as dysfunctional in relation to the goals and aspirations of the country. Academic standards, support for teachers, instructional materials, school buildings, classrooms and equipment had declined for lack of financing and good management. Although much of the data for the early 1980s are missing, existing information shows that allocations to education measured as a percentage of GNP declined during that period.

Constrained by the decline in government revenue for nearly a decade, there was a dramatic cutback in financing in the education sector. By 1985, the government's education budget had declined to one-third its 1976 size. The percentage of GDP going to education fell from 6.4 per centin 1976 to 1.0 per cent in 1983 and slightly up to 1.7 per cent in 1985. During that period,the share of education in the national recurrent budget fell from 38 per cent in 1976 to 27 per cent in 1984, when basic education's share of the total education sector budget was 44 per cent. In 1986, 88 per cent of the education recurrent budget went into payment of salaries and allowances, leaving only 12 per cent for non-wage items. According to the Ministry of Education (1994), the unit cost for a primary pupil's education dropped fromUS$41 in 1975 to US$16 in 1983. The education sector

thus lacked the financial resources needed to expand education services and improve their quality. There is reason to believe that spending during this period was below 2 per cent of GDP and may have been as low as 1 per cent. By 1985, the system could be described as "clinically dead"(Fobih et al, 1996).

These circumstances and the government's orientation towards social services favoured a radical reform to reverse the downward spiral of educational standards. The content and structure of the reform touched all levels of the education system and attempted to address the perennial problems of access, retention, curriculum relevance, teacher training, provision of physical structures and financing.

Conditions within the education sector also provoked the initiation of the reform. Prominent among them was a system unresponsive to the socio-economic needs of the country because of the highly academic nature of its content, processes and products.

As a result of Ghana's economic decline and the harsh revolutionary zeal of the military regime that took charge in 1981, a significant number of trained and highly qualified teachers left the country, mostly for Nigeria. By the mid-1980s, around 50 per cent of all teachers in primary and middle schools were untrained. Textbooks, teaching materials, chalk, notebooks, registers and desks were in short supply. Teaching and learning at the basic education level had deteriorated to the extent that the mass of school leavers lacked literacy skills (UNICEF, 1993). Confidence in Ghana's once enviable education system was seriously shaken.

A comparative look at enrolment figures for the 1987/88 and the 1997/98 academic years shows overall increases at all levels as shown in Table 4. In spite of the overall increases, demographic factors and the lack of growth of infrastructure and seem to be causing stagnation of enrolment ratios. While Ghana's population is growing at the rate of 2.5 per cent per annum (Population Census 2000), that of school age children (6-11) is growing at 3.8 per cent per

annum. It is clear that the population of school age children is growing faster than the estimated annual population growth rate.

Table 4: Change in Enrolment over Reform Period by Level

Level	1987/88	1997/98	% increase
Primary	1,625,137	2,333,504	43.6
JSS	180,855	260,172	43.8
SSS	20,153	57,708	186.3
Polytechnic	11,407+	15,179*	
University	8,342	25,280	203.0

Note: +Data for 1993/94   *Figures for 1996/97

Source: Ministry of Education, (1999).

By the 1985-86 school year, about 27 per cent of six-year-old children were not in school (Ministry of Education, 1994). Enrolment ratios varied across the countryand were lowest in the northern part. About 75 per cent of primary school graduates did not go on to secondary school. There was no substitute apprenticeship or training programmes for this big corps of young Ghanaians. Added to these problems was the long duration of pre-tertiary schooling, inadequate procedures for assessing students' progress, and a lack of data needed for meaningful planning, policy and management decisions.

3.2   The Reforms in the Education Sector

3.2.1   The Process
The reform of the education sector became part of the government's revolutionary language between 1982 and 1985. In practice, the government was able to inject some needed materials such as stationery and books into the education system through the ERP and support from a World Bank Health and Education Rehabilitation Project. Among the conditions for funding support from the IMF and World Bank was an improvement in public sector management and, in particular, rehabilitation of the decaying education system.

As a first step toward the implementation of the conditions, the government turned to a report issued in 1974, "New Content and Structure for Education" which had never been fully implemented, and convened in 1983 a conference of Directors of Education to appraise the suitability of the report for adoption. It was noted at the conference that the capital outlay proposed in the 1974 report was too huge. For instance, it called for building schools and providing equipment comparable to the standards obtaining in secondary-technical institutions, that is, well-constructed workshops, science laboratories, home science blocks and so on. Participants at the conference called for a reduction of the capital-intensive components and proposed that the Planning Division of the Ministry devise a five-year plan for implementing the reform within the budgetary constraints of the GES. In addition, the Division was required to revise the school curriculum to reflect the current needs of the country.

Earlier in the 1980s, an Education Commission (which had only advisory powers) replaced the Ghana Education Service Council (GESC) which had hitherto had the final authority in professional matters in GES. The Ministry of Education asked the Education Commission to review the state of the education system and make recommendations to the government. The Commission was assisted by three consultants from Nigeria, Kenya and Brazil, and was made up of a cross-section of professionals such as clergy, army personnel, university lecturers, teachers, writers, politicians, lawyers and educators. It collected information through a number of channels: (i) visits to institutions; (ii) interviews with individuals and organizations; (iii) advertisements to the general public to submit memoranda and educational literature; and (iv) distribution of questionnaires to individuals and organizations to solicit their views on basic education.

The structure and content of pre-university education, research, technical and vocational education costs and finances were reviewed by this Commission from reports of nine previous commissions and committees formed since 1960 on higher education.

The Education Commission issued an initial report in 1984, which began with reference to an address by Ghana's President to the Commission: that our children must *"grow up free from the stultifying influence of the educational oppression which has prevailed for far too long."* He observed that a system which denies the majority of children equal educational opportunities, which values conformity before creativity and which encourages self-interest cannot be described as anything other than oppressive. He, therefore, charged the Commission to formulate *"recommendations of national policy on education such as will enable the realization of the objectives of the revolutionary transformation of the society in the interest of social justice"* (See Fobih et al, 1996).

Later in 1986, another part of the Education Commission's report was submitted to government. In this report, the Commission tried to show that its proposal represented the views of a cross-section of the population and that:

> *They do not differ in many ways from those made by the Dzobo Committee on which the 1974 New Structure and Content of Education in Ghana is based. They can be regarded as endorsing, emphasizing and amplifying those proposals, save in some crucial areas where novel proposals are advanced (Ghana, 1986).*

In addition, it was recommended that the new scheme commence in 1990, with entry into grade one of the first cohort or pupils in the nine-year basic education course. This was to

> *Give the country some breathing space (three years) to prepare the teachers, to procure sufficient textbooks and other teaching materials, to have improved the building and other equipment base, and to have obtained prior commitment to the new scheme. By 1999, the old system would have been phased out as the first Certificates of Basic Education are awarded (Ghana, 1986).*

In conclusion,

> *The new ideas will have to be explained widely, using all available agencies such as the mass media, Information Services Department, religious organizations, Traditional Councils and the revolutionary organs so that they are understood by parents, teachers and the general public ... for a smooth transition to be attained* (Ghana, 1986).

On October 15, 1986, the Secretary of Education announced a sweeping policy reform. This might have become necessary in the face of public loss of confidence and bureaucratic disenchantment with the existing education system and in a spirit of revolutionary zeal. An underlying assumption was that primary schools had been reformed in 1975; its strategic thrust was to start large-scale reform at the Junior Secondary School (JSS) level rather than piecemeal reform at the primary level. This decision raised some criticisms.

Critics argued that the reform policies had not been adequately vetted within the education sector. The apparent lack of consultation can be attributed to the top-down philosophy of government as opposed to a bottom-up approach. According to Fobih et al. (1996), the regime viewed itself as a government with decisive policies and actions rather than a consultative government. Therefore, to engage in elaborate discussion and sampling of views from the public would mean a show of weakness and a subtraction from its role of directing the destiny of the country. Moreover, the Education Commission was representative of the society and was working within tight time constraints.

The final structure and content of the reform approved by government in 1987 was not the same as that proposed in 1974. Even though substantial components of the reform emanated from the 1974 report, as argued by the commission, the time lapse between 1974 and 1987 was more than a decade, and that period had seen great transformations in societal structures, science, technology, education theory and practice among other things.

3.2.2. The Principles

According to the Secretary of Education, the principles underlying the reform are: (i) education is a basic right for every citizen, so the majority of citizens can participate in national development when they are literate or well educated; (ii) people need a cultural identity; (iii) education must be geared towards practical skills; and (iv) citizens must acquire scientific and technological skills for adaptability and they need an awareness of their environment (Ministry of Education, 1986).

In maintaining the principles of the reform, the following actions were to be taken into consideration:

(a)   A reduction of pre-university education from 17 years to 12 years in order to make funds available to improve access and quality.[1]   The 12-year course would consist of a nine-year basic education followed by a three-year senior secondary education, as proposed by the 1974 Reform Commission. This would replace the existing six-year primary, four-year middle school, five-year senior secondary (lower) and two-year senior secondary (upper) cycles. An estimated 30 per cent of junior secondary pupils would continue on to senior secondary schools

(b)   A philosophy of education that would influence national thinking and planning.

(c)   Entrants into teacher training institutions would posses a secondary education.

---

[1] The 17 years used to describe the duration of pre-university education was misleading. It was calculated as follows: six years primary education, plus four years middle school, plus five years secondary school education, plus two years sixth form education. In practice, however, most pupils did not attend the full four years of middle school. Some pupils sat and passed the Common Entrance Examination (CEE) in primary six, middle form 1 or form 2 and then left for secondary school. Others sat from JSS form 1, 2, or 3 and others still sat after sixth or seventh grade from preparatory school. Only very weak pupils or those with some peculiar problems ran the full length of the middle school before sitting for the CEE. Thus, in practice, the duration of the pre-university education ranged from 13 years or less for those who sat for CEE in primary six to the theoretical maximum of 17 years.

(d)   Teacher trainees would be treated on a par with all other trainees and paid allowances.

(e)   Local community participation in the provision of basic education would be mobilized without waiting for decentralization to be completely implemented.

3.2.3. Guidelines for the Reforms

The Ministry of Education (1986) established the following guidelines in order to achieve the objectives outlined for basic education:

(a)   The local language will be the medium of instruction for the first three years of primary school and each pupil will learn his or her language plus another Ghanaian language. The study of Ghanaian languages will be compulsory up to senior secondary school. English will be taught as a subject from the first year at school and become the medium of instruction in the fourth grade of primary school.

(b)   Rote learning and memorization of facts are not to be encouraged at the basic level. Teaching and education will be reoriented to impart skills rather than purely academic knowledge, which by itself does not promote full development. To ensure this, teaching should be shown to encourage inquiry, creativity, and manual skills. Therefore, teachers who are untrained and inefficient middle-school leavers will eventually be replaced and there would be continuous in-service training programmes for practicing teachers in order to eradicate ineffective teaching.

(c)   To minimize the incidence of dropouts, a national literacy campaign will be mounted, and all committees for the implementation of the Junior Secondary School Programme at regional, district, and community levels will be assisted in carrying out the campaign on a continuing basis. In cases where dropouts cannot re-enter the formal system, provision will be made for them in adult and non-formal education programmes.

(d)   A 40-week school year will be run by private and public schools.

(e)   Progress throughout basic education will be based on continuous and guidance-oriented assessment by teachers and headmasters. Terminal assessment and certification for basic education will be based on 40 per cent internal continuous assessment and 60 per cent external assessment, to be conducted by the West African Examinations Council[2]. This terminal assessment and certification will form the basis for selection into senior secondary schools and other post-basic training institutions.

(f)   The national government will continue to rely on and encourage the efforts made by communities to provide infrastructures for schools. It is also expected that various education committees, churches and voluntary organizations, as well as private individuals, will continue their vital roles in support of the provision of basic education.

(g)   The joint responsibility of providing basic education by the government, communities and all other stakeholders will ensure the right of every Ghanaian child to education and in turn lay a sound foundation for socio-economic development in the country.

Other aspects of the reform were to

(a)   Contain and partially recover costs and embark on a withdrawal of feeding and lodging subsidies from secondary and tertiary institutions;

(b)   Enhance sector management and budgeting procedures through a merger of planning, budgeting, monitoring and evaluation functions; and

(c)   Decentralize decision-making and supervision from the region to the district and circuit levels, and increase the level of school visitation and supervision.

In line with the major recommendations of the reports of the Education Commission and Conference of Directors of Education as well as the framework of the Education Structure Adjustment Programme, the government began to

---

[2] The proportion is now 30% internal and 70% external assessment.

restructure pre-university education to meet national educational objectives and aspirations.

3.3   Tertiary Education – Conditions and Reforms

Over the 1970s and the early 1980s, the tertiary education sector was in a deplorable state in terms of financial provision and physical infrastructure, and also in terms of the relationship between the institutions and the government. Morale on the campuses was poor, staff recruitment and retention was low, there were regular interruptions in the academic year caused by disputes with both staff and students and between staff and students. There was an exodus of staff to seek greener pastures in Nigeria and elsewhere. Near complete economic collapse and constant political crises had left the universities with irregular and insufficient funding. These issues made rational academic and financial planning virtually impossible. Teaching and especially research work declined significantly and affected standards.

A major re-formulation of tertiary education policy was therefore called for in the late 1980s, following the initiation of the reforms at the basic and secondary levels. Following public debate on the need for tertiary education sector reform, the Provisional National Defense Council (PNDC) appointed the University Rationalization Committee (URC) that formulated the policy framework, first in an Interim Report in late 1987 and later in a Final Report in 1988.

The two Reports contain a comprehensive and detailed summary of the issues that faced the tertiary education sector. Prominent among them were:

    a.   The need for uniform and efficient management of tertiary education with the added concern of making it cost-effective;

    b.   The need to design academic programmes and courses, which would provide relevant and integrated education for students in the tertiary system;

    c.   The provision of facilities and personnel to provide services to meet the requirements for quality education of increasing numbers

of students that might be admitted into tertiary institutions, through efficient utilization of space, resources and personnel;

d.   The need to make adequate arrangements to meet the financial requirements of tertiary institutions not only from public funds, but also from private and institutional sources. The institutions should plan and seek support for income-generating activities. It is important to make recommendations for proper control and accountability in the use of funds at the disposal of the institutions; and

e.   The need to make projections for the future expansion of tertiary education taking into consideration the facilities and resources required and available, as well as those can be provided.

The URC put forward 166 recommendations, which formed the basis for the government White Paper titled "Reforms to the Tertiary Education System" issued in 1991. The reforms paid particular attention to the need for:

-   an integrated and co-ordinated tertiary education sector under the general supervision, direction and control of the Ministry of Education;

-   greater cost-effectiveness and institutional income generation. To that effect a system of cost-sharing for the financing of tertiary education is to be established between government, students and the private sector;

-   restructuring tertiary institutions such as diploma–awarding institutions to improve cost-effectiveness, upgrade the quality of teaching and increase output. This involves establishing university colleges from the existing, diploma-awarding institutions;

-   increased access for 'qualified people' and improved gender balance;

-   production of more appropriate proportions of higher level and middle-level personnel;

-   greater relevance to and articulation with the workplace and employment opportunities; and

-   better management in all the tertiary education institutions.

As a complementary means of increasing access to tertiary education and improving cost-effectiveness for both government and students, the concept of Distance Education was given special emphasis. The Distance Education programme is, however, yet to be implemented in earnest. With the exception of the University College of Winneba that inaugurated its programme about two years ago with a modest grant from the UK government's Department for International Development (DFID), the other universities are yet to complete their printed materials for prospective distance learners and the University of Development Studies has not even made a start.

Just as in the case of the pre-tertiary level, the tertiary education sector was due for reforms by the time SAP took off in Ghana. The tertiary sector had deteriorated under the general economic conditions of the last two decades. Even though the reforms were started under the First Education Sector Adjustment Credit (EDSAC) of 1986 and supported through the Second Education Sector Adjustment Credit of 1990, they were not formalized until 1991 when the government White Paper on tertiary education reform was issued (White Paper on University Rationalization 1991).

The highlights of the reforms are:

a. Academic autonomy of the institutions remains unchanged. However, all institutions of higher learning are to come under the general supervision and direction of the MOE with regard to policy formulation and monitoring;

b. Supervision of the sector would be undertaken by the MOE and assisted by an Advisory Education Commission. (This was later changed to National Council for Tertiary Education (NCTE) in 1993);

c. To improve cost-effectiveness, upgrade the quality of teaching and increase output, university colleges are to be established from the existing diploma-awarding institutions;

d. To improve access to tertiary education, a university in the north of the country is to be established. In addition, there will be the introduction of new action-

oriented degree programmes in priority areas of development like agriculture industry;

e. A system of cost-sharing will be established for the financing of tertiary education between government, students and the private sector;

f. By 1994, the curricula of tertiary institutions are to be adjusted and made compatible with those of the new secondary school system; and

g. Distance education is to be pursued as an alternative mode of delivering and increasing access to university education (White Paper on University Rationalisation, 1991, pp 64-68).

The decision by the government to restructure the tertiary education sector through cost-sharing and cost-recovery measures and thereby save the system from total collapse appears to have gained public acceptance. At least this was the consensus reached by participants at the Open Forum organized by the Ministry of Education at the International Conference Centre in 1999. Whether the goals of these reforms can be achieved in the near future in view of the public's concern about the hardships of the SAP felt by the average worker is a question that has to be addressed. (This issue is further discussed in chapter six of this report).

3.4   Background and Objectives of Structural Adjustment

During the 1950s, Ghana was considered as one of the more developed countries in sub-Saharan Africa. Per capita income was very high by African standards, the educational system was the best in Africa and infrastructure and government institutions were relatively well developed. This means that Ghana once enjoyed a relatively high standard of living compared with most other African nations. Unfortunately, poor economic policies, drought, and increases in oil prices led to a decline in gross domestic product (GDP) in the 1970s and early 1980s. The Ghanaian economy thus deteriorated steadily during this period. The period was characterized by persistent high inflation, declining production and export, flourishing illegal activities and political instability. A decline in per capita income increased the incidence of absolute poverty accompanied by a worsening

of income distribution, growing unemployment, and the emigration of skilled professionals. This was the cumulative effect of a downward spiral, which in turn resulted from the interaction of poor domestic economic policies and adverse external events. Large government deficits during the 1970s induced in part by the need to support an inefficient parastatal system and provide public sector employment, led to accelerating rates of inflation. As a result, the fixed nominal exchange rate became over-valued and created a major disincentive for exports. At the same time the enormous profits in trading imported goods shifted the emphasis of the economy from production to trade and induced serious corruption in the import license allocation system. The decline in exports reduced the government tax base and real government revenue declined, resulting in marked deterioration in critical infrastructure, including schools, roads, railways, electricity and telecommunication.

In the early 1980s, three shocks caused Ghana's limping economy to collapse completely: the terms of trade deteriorated sharply, drought reduced agricultural output, and Nigeria expelled over one million Ghanaian workers. In response to the crisis, Ghana launched a series of reform initiatives namely, the Economic Recovery Programme (ERP) and the Structural Adjustment Programme (SAP). These programmes were supported by the World Bank with co-financing by the International Monetary Fund.

Phase 1 of the reforms included:
-       Restoration of macro-economic balance.
-       Establishment of realistic exchange rates.
-       Removal of quantitative controls, particularly in trade and reduction of taxes in agriculture.
-       Rehabilitation of basic infrastructure.

Phase 2 reforms covered:
-       Private sector development and export promotion.
-       Promotion of divestiture of state-owned enterprises.

- Public sector restructuring and downsizing.
- Financial sector rehabilitation and liberalization.
- Reallocation of public investment and expenditure towards health, education and infrastructure.

The Economic Recovery Programme (1983–1986) preceded the Structural Adjustment Programme. The policy package in the ERP sought to reform prices and restate production incentives, arrest a runaway rate of inflation, realign interest rates, reduce budget deficits, rehabilitate the rundown physical infrastructure and establish the proper priorities for the allocation of scarce foreign exchange resources.

The Economic Recovery Programme focused on macro-economic policies and addressed economic distortion and imbalances. By 1986, substantial progress had been made in stabilizing the economy. But the economy faced major structural problems; these included deteriorating exports, a weak financial system which hindered mobilization of savings and private investment, stagnant agriculture and weak public administration. In order to lay a firm base for sustained growth, the government broadened the reform effort through programmes of structural adjustment. The objectives of the Structural Adjustment Programme (SAP) were to:

a) Establish an incentive framework that would stimulate growth, encourage savings and investment and strengthen the balance of payments; and

b) Improve resource use, particularly in the public sector, and direct resources to key areas of adjustment, while ensuring fiscal and monetary stability.

SAP further aimed at a reduced role of the state in the production sectors, planned rehabilitation of infrastructure and the overall improvement in incentives for the private sector. Under SAP, public investment was expected to be stepped up to rehabilitate essential economic and social infrastructure and support the recovery

of the private sector. The increased flows to education and health and the restructuring of the expenditure to emphasize primary education and primary health care, aimed at reversing the downward slide of these sectors.

3.5 SAP and the Education Sector

The Structural Adjustment Programme has influenced the education sector in many ways. The sector was severely affected by the general economic decline of the 1970s and 1980s. Macro-economic constraints led to limited expenditure in the education sector, which in turn led to personnel deficits, inadequate support services and ineffective administrative capacity.

Following some economic successes achieved under the ERP and the reversal of the decline in the provision of education services, the government launched the educational reform of 1987 with the following objectives: reduce the length of pre-university education; improve pedagogic efficiency; raise the quality and relevance of educational outcomes; and enhance sector management and budgeting procedures.

Through SAP, the government introduced the tertiary education reforms in a bid to resolve problems with the academic community. The government thus granted massive infusions of budgetary resources, substantial salary increase, and a highly subsidized loan scheme for students. The government further proposed to establish an integrated tertiary education system comprising all post-secondary pre-service training institutions. Major programme components included restructuring and upgrading of institutions; review of course curriculum, revival of research; rehabilitation of facilities and upgrading of staff; expansion to increase access and equity; improved management; greater efficiency and unit cost control and diversification of funding sources.

It is, however, evident that many of the government proposals for tertiary education sector development have not materialized. Almost the entire cost of tertiary education continues to be met from the central government budget. Cost

recovery and income generation by the higher institutions are still very minimal. Furthermore, government funding for the running of tertiary institutions is still very low, making it difficult or almost impossible for these institutions to carry out aspects of the reforms, such as the revival of research and upgrading of staff. This situation has worsened the access to and the quality of tertiary institutions in the country. (See section 3.7 below).

3.6 World Bank/IMF Position on Tertiary Education

Although World Bank policy on the education sector places emphasis on the development of basic education it is equally involved in the development of tertiary education in Ghana. To that extent, the conditions related to its education sector loans are valid for both the pre-tertiary and tertiary sectors.

Conditions set by the World Bank for loans to the education sector have received mixed reactions from the government and the private sector. To both the Ministry of Finance and the Ministry of Education, the conditions set by the Bank are prerequisites for efficient running of the educational sector. For instance, conditions regarding basic education were that the population of non-teaching professionals in the system should be reduced and kept at a level below that of the teacher population. According to the staff of the Project Management Unit (PMU), the unit within the Ministry of Education charged with overseeing implementation of programmes funded by loans and other support from foreign creditors, these conditions are meant to ensure improved efficiency of programme implementation.

The conditions for World Bank assistance to the tertiary education sector have been the following:

  a) Control of intake and enrolment by government and the institutions;

  b) Reduction of the tertiary education share of the government budget and actual expenditure on education. (The tertiary education share

is to be limited to a maximum of 18% of the education share of the budget);

c) Implementation of cost-recovery mechanisms. Tertiary institutions are expected to generate income; beneficiaries are to contribute 10% of the cost; communities and other shareholders should also contribute.

d) Reduction of worker population to a total of 30% of the student population.

e) Establishment of a mechanism for the annual review of the public expenditure programme for tertiary education with IDA through the Public Investment Programme (PIP). Government has to put in place 10% of the cost of the programme;

f) Implementation of an acceptable student loan scheme;

g) Procurement of materials through international competition; and

h) Establishment of a joint mid-term review regime.

In addition to these conditions, it was stated that:
- The Ministry of Education Co-ordination Unit should be established.
- A project accountant deposit should be established, and
- A selection of organizations should assist the procurement.[3]

Critics of the World Bank are not happy about these conditions and think that some of them even negate the development of the tertiary education sector. Such conditions include the control of intake and enrolment by the government and institutions, limitation of the tertiary education share of government budget and actual expenditure on education and the issue of cost sharing. According to the critics, the World Bank dictates within the framework of the loans it gives. In addition, many structural adjustment programmes, not only in Ghana, have been criticized for being too rigid and imposing too many conditions on countries. Even some economists basically in favour of the initial conditions have also raised such criticisms.

Furthermore, according to Herbst (1993), "the Fund, Bank and PNDC concentrated on targets, dates and wording of measures rather than how to implement them. They had too little staff time to access (sic) domestic political support for measures or how appropriate they were to Ghana's administrative or economic circumstances. This omission created problems for (the) implementation" of the conditions.

The critics' objection to the condition that there should be control of intake and enrolment by government and the institutions as well as the condition that limits tertiary education's share of the government budget and actual expenditure on education have been vindicated by the events that took place between 1994-1998 when graduates from both the old and the new secondary school systems converged on the tertiary institutions. From this example, it is evident that for government to be able to control tertiary enrolment, it would have to increase its own budgetary allocation to the tertiary institutions.

These criticisms notwithstanding, Ghana's SAP has gained recognition in some international quarters for its coherence and a policy framework that has shaped developments in the tertiary education sector. Since the major review undertaken in 1986-88, considerable effort and resources have been directed towards improving the quality and accessibility of tertiary education. It appears that the gains from this investment are now beginning to be felt. Progress has been made in a number of areas, both at the institutional level and in the development of the national infrastructure necessary for system co-ordination and quality assurance.

However, other aspects of policy implementation have proceeded more slowly than might have been anticipated. These include the expansion of distance education as an alternative mode of delivering tertiary education; cost-sharing, where beneficiaries are to contribute 10% of cost of financing tertiary education,

---

[3] Personal communication between Fredriksson et al. (1998) and Mr. Victor Nortey, Project Manager, Ministry of Education, Project Management Unit (PMU)

while communities and other stakeholders are to contribute their own quota; and a reduction of workers' population to a total of 30% of the student population.

Implementation of the reform programme has been undertaken in a period of worldwide economic slowdown, competing demand for increased budgetary allocation and attention by other social service sectors of the Ghanaian economy, and changes in the political landscape. The country's political structures now appear to be smoothening (with democracy firmly established) and transparency and accountability are gradually being accepted as key principles of public sector management. In addition, with the government embarking on sound macro- and micro-economic policies, the prospects for more rapid development and consolidation appear therefore to be good.

In this context, the main task for Ghanaian policy makers in the education sector should be to review seriously the experience of the last decade and use their understanding to shape the framework that will take the tertiary education system through the 21st century. The Akyeampong Committee's 1998 assessment provides an excellent basis for this exercise. Its report suggested that the priority areas for future investment should probably be those of polytechnic education and the development of tertiary education information and communication technology capabilities. However, all such developments should be well grounded within previous and current experience and constraints, and driven by the anticipated needs of the country and its people.

3.7 Ghana Government's Position on Tertiary Education
3.7.1 Priority areas of attention
Five priority areas that need government attention, namely cost-sharing, creation of new tertiary institutions, integration of tertiary education institutions, gender equity in tertiary education and education for the disabled, are discussed below.

3.7.1.1. Cost-sharing in the Tertiary Education Sector

Almost the entire cost of tertiary education continues to be met from the central government budget. Cost recovery and income generation from services provided by the institutions are minimal. The government's intention is to shift some of the cost of funding tertiary education from the government to students and parents.

The general idea is that the cost of accommodation should be borne by parents and students. This is primarily about food, but also to some extent lodging. Instead of getting everything free, most students receive a loan from the Social Security and National Insurance Trust (SSNIT). This is about ¢1,000,000 a year. The boarding system has a long history in Ghana and there are strong arguments in favour of this system. It contributes to ethnic integration in Ghanaian society and provides the facilities needed for studies that cannot always be provided in the home.

How the cost sharing with respect to accommodation should be organized is still a subject for debate. Some senior secondary schools still receive subventions from the government that make it possible to keep the boarding fees paid by the parents below the real cost of accommodation. Students in teacher training colleges receive an allowance that covers food and boarding. Most tertiary students have to take care of their own feeding, but still get free boarding. With the growing number of students, the government cannot afford these costs.

The universities are supposed to move away from being residential to being increasingly non-residential, with students expected to find their own accommodation. In Accra, for example, it is difficult to find any accommodation for students, and where this is found, it is most likely to be in town, which means that the students have to commute about 20km to and from the university in Legon. The problem is compounded by the poor transportation system in Accra. On the Legon campus, it is common for several students to occupy one room meant for two students and the universities tend to turn a blind eye to the problem. The overcrowded hostels create pressure on campus facilities, leading to the breakdown of sanitary facilities and to frequent power cuts.

3.7.1.2. New Tertiary Institutions

With the rapid expansion of enrolment at senior secondary level, the need for more tertiary level institutions has increased, and the government recognizes that new tertiary institutions will be required over time. However, the University Rationalization Committee (1987) recommended that in view of national needs, any future expansion of tertiary education should aim at broadening the technological base of the economy, hence technical colleges, polytechnics and training colleges may have to be developed more rapidly than universities.

An issue with the tertiary education reform, which has generated controversy, is the opening of the new university in the north; that is, the University of Development Studies (UDS). While other universities have been part of the World Bank supported tertiary programme, UDS has received very little support from the World Bank programme. The official reasons for the World Bank's position vis-à-vis the UDS are not known, but it is not very difficult to guess where the problem lies. The government had difficulties in financing the three universities that already existed before the opening of the UDS. Even if the reasons for opening a university in the North are very strong, available funds are already insufficient to provide the existing three universities with adequate resources. The UDS does not receive any extra funding; it only receives the same basic allocation or even less from the government (Fredriksson et al., 1998).

3.7.1.3. Integration of Tertiary Education Institutions – The Idea of RECAAST.

One of the objectives of the tertiary education reforms is to integrate all tertiary institutions under the Ministry of Education. This would embrace the universities, the polytechnics, the Regional Colleges of Applied Arts Science and Technology (RECAAST) and several post-secondary educational institutes, which had earlier been under respective sector ministries (nurses training colleges under the Ministry of Health, agricultural colleges under the Ministry of Lands and Natural Resources). The reason for the integration of the tertiary institutions is to ensure

effective policy formulation and monitoring in the area of tertiary level pre-service training and all other areas of tertiary education (URC, 1988). Another reason is to increase access and equity, improve management and ensure efficiency and unit-cost control. The integration also aims at upgrading all tertiary institutions. In this connection, the curricula of the institutions are to be reviewed, research is to be revived, human capacity is to be upgraded and facilities are to be rehabilitated. The ultimate goal of RECAAST is to establish a vertical linkage between the pre-tertiary and tertiary institutions.

Unfortunately, the projected linkage between the tertiary institutions and the pre-tertiary sectors has not been well developed. As a result, transition from pre-tertiary to tertiary level has been rather erratic. Although enrolment at the tertiary level in absolute terms has increased since the 1991/92 tertiary education reforms, these institutions are incapable of absorbing thousands of students who qualify each year from the pre-tertiary institutions. According to records over the past decade or so, less than 40% of students who qualify to enter into the tertiary institutions have been absorbed (See Table 5). This inability to absorb pre-tertiary students is due to, among other things, the:

- unit cost of education at tertiary level which is still very high,
- inability to provide sustained financial resources,
- insufficiency of student loans, and
- lack of expansion of equipment and facilities in the tertiary institutions.

3.7.1.4. Gender Equity in Tertiary Education

Increasing female enrolment at all levels of the educational system is one of the major concerns of the government. The Ghana Living Standards Survey (GLSS III) enrolment profile indicates a gender gap among all school-age children. The gap increases after age 11. On the average, age-specific enrolment rates for girls of primary school age are approximately 10% lower than those of boys of the same age group. The situation worsens as one moves from the basic, through secondary, to the tertiary level. The skewed ratio to the disadvantage of girls is worse at tertiary level. For instance, in 1992, whereas the proportion of girls to

boys at the basic level was 45:55 at the primary and 41:59 at the JSS, it was 22:78 at the tertiary level. Table 5 gives details of the male-female student enrolment for the universities of Ghana, Cape Coast and the Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology for the period between 1987 and 1999.

It could be inferred from the Table that, during the period between 1987 and 1999, the universities of Ghana, Cape Coast and Science and Technology recorded an average of 24.26%, 22.63% and 18.19% female enrolment respectively. The story is the same for the polytechnics, which recorded an average of 25.1% female enrolment per year between 1991 and 1997. The female enrolment rate in the tertiary institutions is therefore woefully inadequate.

There is also gender inequity at the regional level. According to Fredriksson (1998), data from the North of Ghana show that enrolment figures there are lower than the national figure for girls and worse than in the south despite the fact that obviously there have been improvements in the north over the years. While the issue of female enrolment at tertiary level is of paramount interest, very little attention has been paid to it in the literature on tertiary education. Increasing female enrolment in tertiary institutions in the country should therefore be seen as an urgent and critical area to be considered seriously in any future tertiary educational restructuring process.

Table 5: University Students Enrolment by Gender (1987/88 – 1998/99).

Session	Institution					
	U.G.		U.C.C.		KNUST	
1987/88						
Male	2876	(80.61)	1248	(83.70)	2926	(83.46)
Female	1692	(19.39)	243	(16.30)	580	(16.54)
1988/89						
Male	2866	(80.41)	1237	(83.41)	2973	(83.46)
Female	698	(19.59)	246	(16.59)	589	(16.54)
1989/90						
Male	3364	(80.36)	1448	(80.53)	3052	(83.46)
Female	822	(19.64)	350	(19.47)	605	(16.54)
1990/91						
Male	3092	(76.97)	1569	(78.45)	3275	(82.29)

Female	925	(23.03)	431	(21.55)	705	(17.71)
1991/92						
Male	3589	(76.38)	1855	(77.16)	3918	(82.41)
Female	1110	(23.62)	549	(22.84)	836	(17.59)
1992/93						
Male	4047	(75.46)	2027	(76.43)	3606	(82.44)
Female	1316	(24.54)	625	(23.57)	768	(17.56)
1993/94						
Male	4131	(73.44)	2467	(76.42)	3639	(81.76)
Female	1494	(26.56)	761	(23.58)	812	(18.24)
1994/95						
Male	5288	(76.02)	3197	(74.81)	3897	(79.69)
Female	1668	(23.98)	1076	(25.19)	993	(20.31)
1995/96						
	0	0	0	0	0	0
1996/97						
Male	5853	(68.9)	3942	(73.22)	5038	(80.76)
Female	2642	(31.1)	1442	(26.78)	1200	(19.24)
1997/98						
Male	6383	(74.17)	5314	(73.14)	6115	(80.34)
Female	2223	(25.83)	1952	(26.86)	1496	(19.66)
1998/99						
Male	6403	(70.40)	5698	(73.79)	6843	(79.82)
Female	2692	(29.60)	2024	(26.21)	1730	(20.18)

Source: Universities of Ghana, Cape Coast and Science and Technology, Basic Statistics, 2000; Ministry of Education.

3.7.1.5. Education for the Disabled

Special education for the handicapped at the tertiary level is also one of the major concerns that need the attention of the Ministry of Education. Unfortunately, asin the case of gender inequity, there has been a dearth of studies on the disabled in tertiary education. The case of basic education is slightly better. It has been disclosed by the Special Education Division of the Ghana Education Service (GES) that since the establishment of Special Education schools over a period of 50 years now, only about 2,500 disabled children have had opportunity of formal education up to the end of basic education. Meanwhile, it is estimated that in 1996/97, there were about 430,000 6-14 year-olds with one form of disability or

the other in the country. It can be inferred therefore that it is only a small fraction of the disabled that are being reached with basic education. The figure is worse at the secondary and tertiary levels.

At senior secondary level, a secondary/technical school and secondary/vocational school have been set up for the deaf, whilst some selected secondary schools within the public system have been equipped to serve as integrated secondary schools for the blind. At the tertiary level, facilities have been set up at the University of Cape Coast to enable blind students to pursue degree courses. An efficient service for handicapped children requires competent staff. The College of Special Education at the University College of Education, Winneba, ensures the fulfillment of this goal. Attempts are also being made to produce more trained teachers for the handicapped. This is being done through the introduction of elements of special education into the curriculum of all teacher-training colleges in Ghana (UNESCO, 1996). All these strategies are geared towards universal accessibility to education irrespective of one's physical condition.

Special education at the tertiary level however has its share of the budgetary constraints that permeate the whole of the education sector. The tertiary institutions are, therefore, not able to provide adequate facilities, equipment and materials for the provision of special education for the disabled.

3.7.2. The Government's Vision on Education

The government's priorities in education, as spelled out in "Ghana Vision 2020", are to achieve universal basic education and adult literacy, increase access to secondary and tertiary education, and strengthen labour force skills through increased provision of technical and vocational training. In line with these objectives, the government launched in 1996 a Basic Education Sector Improvement Programme, with the assistance of the World Bank and other creditors.

Implementation of the programme is, however, facing difficulties as teaching and learning goals are not being achieved. The government intends to address these problems through a number of actions to be adopted in close coordination with donors. These include the preparation of plans with clearly defined targets; allocation of resources towards disadvantaged groups; decentralization of management of education and improvement of the capacity of the Ministry of Education and the Ghana Education Service. Expenditure in education in general is expected to increase from 3.8 per cent of GDP in 1998 to 4.1 per cent in 2001.

3.8   Civil Society's Reaction to SAP

While the goal of educational reforms and the restructuring of basic and secondary education have generally been applauded, parts of the reform package have generated intense debate and controversy. The reform of higher education has been the most contentious. University students have been galvanized into protest action over what they perceive to be a concerted effort to devalue, rather than enhance, higher education. Their protests have led to the shutting down of the universities on a number of occasions.

Campus students' criticisms of the government's university reforms revolve around the 'cost-recovery costs', to borrow Bentsi-Enchill's felicitous phrase (Daddieh, 1995). The students have protested against the new 'pay as you go' educational ethos of the government on the grounds that shifting the burden of boarding and lodging to parents would drive poorer students out of school. The non-residential policy would be similarly discriminatory, because the universities are concentrated in the main cities and thus favour urban students or those with strong urban ties. It would raise the cost of higher education for residents of rural areas who would be forced to pay high prices for rent as well as contend with the vagaries of the transportation system. Furthermore, they have expressed opposition to the loan scheme because it would merely postpone the financial burden until they begin gainful employment even though their salaries are unlikely to be enough to feed their families, if current trends continue.

It is interesting to note that the students' view seem to be supported by Akilagpa Sawyerr, a serious-minded educator and former vice-chancellor of University of Ghana, Legon. Professor Sawyerr acknowledges that the introduction of the cost-recovery concept in education is 'an extension of the process of privatization' spreading through the national economy (hospital fees, abolition of subsidies, attacks on state enterprises, etc). He concedes that these measures may be individually defensible on economic grounds, but worries that their combined effects 'foreshadow a basic change in the way social costs are allocated' in Ghanaian society (Daddieh, 1995).

3.9   Critique

3.9.1   Introduction

Throughout much of sub-Saharan Africa the unrelenting recessionary pressures are compelling governments either to introduce education reforms as part of the overall efforts to restructure their economies, or at the very least, to place them on the national agenda for public debate (Daddieh, 1995). Reform has generally been preceded by, as well as linked to, the privatization, deregulation and liberalization measures that have been mandated by the Bretton Woods institutions and reluctantly embraced by African states struggling to keep their economies afloat and avert social catastrophe. With the implementation of the reforms, some benefits are supposed to accrue to the government by way of sharing costs with the beneficiaries of tertiary education.

3.9.2   Funding the New System

In Ghana, substantial cost-savings are expected to be realised from the structural changes and from improved cost accounting. At the insistence of the World Bank, which is opposed to what are perceived to be disproportionately high amounts spent on higher education by African governments, part of the burden of tertiary education is being shifted from the government to the student beneficiaries and their families. In the long run, the total burden of paying for food and lodging, estimated at about $200 per student per annum, or half of per

capita income, is to be shifted to parents.[4] Critics of the educational reforms view this policy thrust as a prelude to the real intention of the government and the Bank, which is to de-emphasize state-sponsoring of higher education while at the same time emphasizing non-residential secondary schools and universities. Supporters of the education reforms argue that a non-residential campus would enable more students to be admitted and lead to more efficient use of limited resources. Their position is based on the fact that in the short term, part of the financing will come from a shifting of budget priorities away from the highly subsidized tertiary education system, which was receiving about 60 per cent of the education budget. In the long term, both the World Bank and the government expect the sector as a whole to become self-financing as the reform progresses.

As a result, cost-recovery measures are being instituted at all levels. These measures have taken the form of retrenchment of non-teaching staff; freezing of teaching staff appointments while student enrolments rise; a two-step elimination of residential and boarding subsidies; increasing user fees; a loan/scholarship system for indigent students; and reduction of financial embezzlement. The new educational ethos envisages a partnership between the private sector, the state and development partners.

3.9.3 Conclusion

The lesson from the Ghanaian experience is that Africa needs to proceed with caution towards educational privatization. In this era of democratisation, officials need to involve the grassroots in serious, open, public dialogue about the development priorities of their societies in order to fashion education systems that fit those priorities. In the meantime, it is worth noting that not all the theoretical promises of privatization are likely to be translatable into practical benefits. Particularly in the area of primary and secondary education, an unabashed

---

[4] A $140-a-year loan scheme has been established to assist indigent students. The loan was to be repaid at 3 per cent annual interest when students commenced working following graduation. The scheme had provoked vehement opposition by the students, who argued that it was a terrible idea at a time when salaries were insufficient to pay even the family food bill. Students graffiti at the University of Science and Technology (UST) dubbed the loan scheme as the 'devil's alternative' See Morna, 'An Exercise in Educational Reform', 37

application of privatization could seriously affect social relations and jeopardize the chances of orderly nation building. Ghana would do well to heed the warning about privatization and the American political firmament so eloquently articulated by Robert Bailey:

Privatization adds another policy instrument to the tools of the public manager and policy maker. If fully aware of the hidden costs, the potential for failure, and the inadequate guarantees for obtaining the efficiencies that theory indicates will accrue, policy makers can decide to privatize. For the public manager, it should not be a matter of ideology, however, but of informed judgment based on experience in public management and on policy analyses more exacting than is currently presented by advocates of privatization...Americans let the market establish the price of pork bellies, not the future of children...Privatization will be applied only to things that the American people are not willing to risk; that includes every policy and programme that several generations have put into place to protect themselves from the whims, uncertainties, instabilities, and unintended consequences of the market place (Robert Bailey, 1987).

Although it is too early to talk about the effects of privatization of tertiary education in Ghana, Philip Foster's (1980) observation is instructive. According to him, in a privatized system, competition for access to the intermediate and higher educational sectors will increase and, if this analysis is correct, then it is the children of the elite of new 'middle classes' who will take advantage of the situation, not only through their possibly higher levels of academic performance, but because their parents know how to use and manipulate the educational system. At this juncture the community emphasis does not hold out much promise for overcoming the inequalities. Differential community resources are likely to translate most powerfully into differential facilities, funds, and performance.

3.10   Preliminary Observations and Recommendations
3.10.1 Introduction

The literature review has raised a number of important issues that may be summarized at this point as preliminary observations. Following the observations, a list of recommendations is provided below for the attention of stakeholders of tertiary education in Ghana.

3.10.2 Preliminary Observations

The review has revealed the following:

- A greater proportion of the sector studies were initiated and /or sponsored by development partners. As many as nine out of the 18 studies reviewed were initiated by development partners/donors.

- Government expenditure on tertiary education declined drastically during the period between 1983-1999. This was as a result of the implementation of the Structural Adjustment Programme, which caused a squeeze in the financing of the education sector in general. The effect of this on access to tertiary education and quality assurance in the country is examined in chapter five of this report.

- Ghana's education system before the introduction of the SAP was in near collapse and was dysfunctional in relation to the goals and aspirations of the country. The World Bank policy, however, emphasizes basic education and stresses that a large part of all resources given to education should be allocated to basic education.

- A system of cost sharing and cost saving for the financing of tertiary education between government, students and the private sector has been seen as the major focus of the Tertiary Education Sector Reform.

- The impact of donor interventions has been more negative in that funding of education has suffered a decline in real terms as a consequence of a constrained fiscal environment.

- The conditions for sustainable quality improvement are not yet in place. This include the implementation of effective financing of tertiary education especially on the issue of cost sharing between the government, students and other stakeholders; also of the difficulty in financing the UDS which receives little support from the World Bank programme and

receives, from the government, the same basic allocation or even less than the other universities.

- Female enrolment rates in tertiary institutions in the country have been woefully inadequate. Female enrolment generally has always lagged behind that of males; but the situation is worse at tertiary level. A comparative look at enrolment figures for the period between 1987 and 1999 showed significant disparities in male/female enrolment ratios, in favour of males at the tertiary level. (See table 5 above).

- Even though special education for the handicapped is one of the major concerns of the government, special education at the tertiary level has its share of the overall constraints that pervade the whole of the education sector.

3.10.3. Recommendations

Bearing in mind the observations made, the following conclusions are worth considering:

- In order to supplement studies initiated by development partners/donors, the government through the Ministry of Education should encourage more studies to assess performance in all the three tiers of the education sector.

- There is an urgent need to look for alternative sources of funding for the educational enterprise and implementation of reforms to avoid further erosion of quality in the tertiary educational system. Student financing will need to be addressed urgently, so that a range of options may be made available to students from differing backgrounds.

- The implementation of SAP has not been very successful. There is therefore the need for a more purposive economic agenda to be put in place for the country. The structural policy reforms should aim at improving quality, increasing efficiency and changing output-mix in the tertiary education sector.

- The possibilities offered by the global development of information and communication technologies should be explored vigorously. This would mean the exploration of new ways of teaching, learning and accessing

knowledge, although with caution regarding the overall constraints currently experienced within the country. The idea of distance education should therefore be pursued vigorously.

- It is suggested that polytechnic education should be a further major focus of future investment, in conjunction with efforts to ensure potential mobility between institutions and sub-sectors, and accreditation of work-based learning.

- In order to boost female enrolment at the tertiary level, the government should consider female education seriously in any future tertiary restructuring process. This would mean sensitising the general public about the essence of female education in the socio-economic development of the nation and making it mandatory for the tertiary institutions to ensure gender balance in their admissions.

- Budgetary allocations to the special education sector should be improved in order to provide universal access to education irrespective of one's physical state.

- A key priority for the government will be that of ensuring a greater allocation of funding to enrolment. There may also be benefit in considering non-traditional (distance, part-time and flexible) modes of providing tertiary education.

- The fact that the development partners emphasize basic education does not imply that the other sectors should be relegated to the background. The educational reforms under SAP will certainly be meaningless if many children end their educational pursuits at the basic or secondary level. Tertiary education reforms should therefore be taken seriously by the government to ensure linkage between pre-tertiary and tertiary education.

CHAPTER FOUR

IMPLEMENTATION OF THE TERTIARY EDUCATION REFORMS

4.1   Introduction

The previous chapter looked at what different writers have said about SAP and tertiary education in Ghana. This and subsequent chapters present the views of stakeholders on the impact of SAP on tertiary education as stated in interviews and FGD sessions conducted in the field by the research team. .   Wherever possible, the views and opinions expressed by the stakeholders have been reproduced with little or no interpolation.

To ensure representativeness of the views and opinions surveyed, the sample of respondents was taken from a wide spectrum of stakeholders of tertiary education. The profile of the survey respondents has been given in Table 2 in chapter 2. As can be seen, the sample can be classified under the following groups of stakeholders: University/Polytechnic   authorities,   namely   (i)   Vice Chancellors/Principals, Registrars, Finance Officers, Deans and Departmental Heads; (ii) Student Representative Council members; (iii) government officials, namely policy makers and implementers, and (iv) development partners.   The views and opinions of parents, opinion leaders (Chiefs, Assembly members) and religious leaders were captured through focus group discussions (FGDs). Table 3 gives a profile of the FGD participants.   Wherever necessary, the views and opinions of these categories of stakeholders have been disaggregated to enable the variation in views to appear.   Again wherever necessary, responses from the interviews and the FGDs are presented in a complementary fashion. As noted in chapter 2, we refer to the interview respondents simply as "respondents" and to the FGD participants simply as "participants" in the rest of the report.

4.2   Assessment of the Reforms

To begin with, all 96 respondents were asked to give their general assessment of the tertiary education reforms. Table 6 gives a summary of their assessment.

Table 6: General Assessment of Tertiary Education Reforms by Respondents

Assessment	No	%
Positive	75	78.1
Negative	4	4.2
No impact	17	17.7
Total	96	100

As can be seen from the table, as many as 78.1 per cent of the 96 respondents were of the view that the tertiary education reforms have been positive. This corroborates the observation made in chapter three that in general, the public is positively disposed to the reforms (see section 3.3).

The tertiary education reforms, however, cover different areas of focus. The respondents were, therefore, asked to indicate the aspect(s) of the reforms they found acceptable. Table 7 gives a summary of the responses.

Table 7: Aspects of Reforms Found Acceptable
N = 96

Aspects of Reforms	%
Establishment of distance education as an alternative mode of increasing access to tertiary education	56.3
Establishment of University Colleges from existing diploma-awarding institutions	55.2
Modification in the autonomy of tertiary institutions	47.9
Supervision of tertiary institutions by NCTE	43.8
Adjusting tertiary institution curricula to that of the new SSS system	41.7
Establishment and maintenance of a University (UDS) in the North	40.6
Implementation of cost-sharing	31.3

Multiple choice

As is to be expected, the introduction of the cost-sharing policy of the reforms was the least acceptable to the respondents. Only 31% of the respondents said they found it acceptable. Information from the FGDs gives insight into why the cost-sharing aspect of SAP is not supported by the participants. According to them:

i   the idea of SAP seems good but its implementation has brought hardships into the economy;

ii   SAP has weakened parents' ability to support their children in tertiary education;

iii cost sharing should be based on parents' ability to pay;

iv   the quality of education has gone down;

v   impact of the reforms has not been felt in the rural areas;

vi   there is too much theoretical learning and too little practical training in tertiary institutions; and

vii there is an over-concentration of tertiary institutions in the southern part of the country.

The introduction of distance education as an alternative mode of increasing access to tertiary education and the establishment of university colleges from existing diploma-awarding institutions top the list of the aspects of reforms acceptable to respondents. Other aspects of the reforms which respondents found acceptable, though with caution, are: modification in the autonomy of the tertiary institutions; supervision by the NCTE; establishment of the UDS; and adjustment of the tertiary institutions to the senior secondary system.

4.3   Constraints affecting Implementation

To find out the constraints **affecting** the implementation of the reforms, the 96 respondents were asked to specify the difficulties they faced or envisioned in the implementation of the reforms. Table 8 provides details of the responses.

Table 8: Constraints affecing the Implementation of the Reforms

N = 96

Constraints	%
Inadequate funding	56.3
Lack of both human and material resources	43.8
Poor implementation and improper supervision	21.9
Resistance by students	6.3
Parents'/students' inability to pay	6.3
Too many ad hoc measures	1.0

Multiple choice

Top of the list of constraints are the lack of adequate funding and the lack of the human and material resources needed to carry out the implementation. Poor supervision of the implementation process was also mentioned as a constraint. Apparently, students' resistance and parents' inability to pay for their wards' education were not regarded as major constraints.

4.4 Distance Education as a Complementary Mode of Tertiary Education Delivery

Distance education as a non-conventional way of education makes more efficient use of existing scarce resources and personnel than the conventional tertiary education system. Its capacity to reach people in isolated areas increases access to education at a more cost-effective rate. It is, therefore, not surprising that it topped the list of aspects of the reform found acceptable to respondents. This position is further confirmed by responses to a follow-up question, which sought to find out the reaction of respondents' institutions/organisations to the idea of distance education as a complementary mode of tertiary education delivery. The responses are summarised in Table 9.

Table 9: Institutions'/Organisations' Position vis-à-vis Distance Education

Position	No	%
Positive	56	58.3
Negative	7	7.3
Indifferent	33	34.4
Total	96	100

Over 58% of the respondents said that their institutions/organisations were positively disposed to the establishment of distance education as a delivery mode complementary to existing tertiary institutions. Table 10 provides information on the reasons given by the respondents for their organisations' position on distance education.

Table 10: Reasons for position on Distance Education

Reasons	No.	%
Creates more access to tertiary education	59	61.5
Pressure from home/work not conducive to learning	2	2.1
Nothing has been done	33	34.4
No infrastructure/equipment	1	1.0
No response	1	1.0
Total	96	100

It is obvious from Table 10 that distance education is seen as a means of increasing access to tertiary education. This is a positive sign of acceptance of the concept of distance education. It is, however, worth noting that over a third of the respondents remarked that nothing positive has been done to promote distance education in the tertiary institutions. Indeed, in reaction to the more direct question as to how much work has been done to promote distance education, 73.9% of the respondents conceded that not much has been put in place for the establishment of distance education programmes in tertiary institutions.

Table 11: Work Done on Distance Education

Work Done	No	%
Appointment of national co-ordinator	12	12.5
Materials/provision of personnel & logistics	11	11.5
Advocacy/discussion level	2	2.1
Nothing/don't know/refused to answer	71	73.9
Total	96	100

The establishment of distance education in the universities and polytechnics is one important means of increasing access in the country's tertiary institutions in a more cost-effective manner to both government and students (and their parents) in future.

The issue of SAP and access to the tertiary institutions is the subject of discussion in the next chapter.

CHAPTER FIVE

ACCESS TO AND QUALITY OF TERTIARY
EDUCATION IN GHANA

5.1   The Concept of Access to Education

The government has shown every indication of its desire to provide education for all Ghanaians, as spelt out in Article 25 of the 1992 constitution of the country. This is further manifested in the country's subscription to the Jontiem Declaration on Education for All and the implementation of education reforms in 1987 and 1991 with a focus on improving quality and access. The University of Ghana (UG), the University of Cape Coast (UCC) and the Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology (KNUST) recorded a change in their respective admission levels from 4,569, 1,491, and 3,506 in 1987 to 4,017, 2,000 and 3,980 in 1991. This picture shows that there was only a moderate increase in admission rates by tertiary institutions in this period.

The government's commitment to increase access became manifest after the tertiary reforms in 1991. The UG, UCC, and KNUST recorded an increase in access levels from 4,017, 2,000 and 3,980 in 1991 to 9,095, 7,722 and 8,573 respectively in 1999.

Shiyan Chao (1998) defines access as "the ability of children to progress through the basic education cycle (grades one to nine) without delay or dropout". This implies every child enrolling in primary class one at age 6 and completing at age 14. According to this author, the degree of access can be measured by participation (i.e. whether or not a child has ever attended school), years of delay (before enrolment) and attainment (number of years of the nine years' basic schooling the child completes). However, Ministry of Education documentation distinguishes between access and participation. Access is taken to mean the initial enrolment of a child in the school system while participation is taken to mean the gross enrolment of all school pupils.

In this report, the operational definition of access to tertiary education is the initial enrolment to tertiary education and not the gross enrolment. This fact is being stressed because initial enrolment to the tertiary institutions has been relatively stable. Besides, the definition of access as initial enrolment is emphasized because the cost of tertiary education is not considered during enrolment. Enrolment is dependent on the qualification of applicants and not on the ability to pay for education.

In spite of the fact that SAP has an ultimate objective of ensuring increased access to tertiary education in the country, the study has revealed that the Ministry of Education has no specific policy with regard to admission/enrolment in all the tertiary institutions. Individual tertiary institutions, however, have some specific policies with regard to admission and enrolment.

5.2   Admissions/Enrolment Policies

As stated above, it is a constitutional requirement to ensure access to education at all the levels of the educational system. This study therefore sought to examine the situation of access at the tertiary level against the backdrop of SAP. To assess the situation, the 60 tertiary education authorities in our sample were asked about the policies that guide admissions/enrolment in their institutions. The responses revealed that admissions/enrolment are guided by four major policies: (i) Academic qualification; (ii) Gender equity; (iii) Programme/course quota; and (iv) Facility/resource availability. These four policy guidelines are applied in various combinations by each of the tertiary institutions.

Table 12: Admission/Enrolment Policies of Tertiary Institution
N = 60

Policies	No	%
Gender equity	35	58
Qualification	33	55
Programme/course offering	4	7
Availability of resources/facilities	3	5

multiple choice

As illustrated in Table 12, admission based on gender equity stood out as the principal policy applied by the authorities of tertiary institutions. Thirty-five out of the 60 tertiary institution authorities interviewed confirmed that their current admission policy is to ensure gender equity/balance in the institutions. This policy is confirmed by the admissions and enrolments statistics taken from all the universities reproduced in Table 5 covering the period 1987/88 -- 1998/99. Considering the fact that enrolment quota of female students moved from 17.4% in 1987/88 to 25.3% in 1998/99 in the universities, it can be argued that the universities have reacted positively to the conditions of SAP, namely to increase female enrolment in the tertiary institutions. The university is, however, far from the 50:50 equity target.

Next in imporance after the policy of gender equity comes the policy of qualification. According to 33 of the 60 tertiary education authorities interviewed, academic qualification is a requirement for admission to the institutions. The institutions have a cut-off point of grades below which students would not be admitted, irrespective of gender. Programmes and courses offered and availability of resources/facilities appear to be given less consideration in the admissions and enrolment exercises of tertiary institutions.

A number of reasons have been given for these admission/enrolment policies by the tertiary institution authorities. Table 13 gives a summary of the reasons.

Table 13: Reasons for Admission/Enrolment Policies
N = 60

Reasons	No	%
Encourage females	34	57
Quality Assurance	21	35
Consideration based on facilities available	6	15
Satisfaction of government proposal	3	5

multiple choice

It can be seen from the table that the "encouragement of females" came up as the most important reason for the adoption of such policies for admission to tertiary

institutions. Fifty-seven per cent of the authorities said that tertiary institutions have adopted admissions policies that aim at opening more avenues for women and encouraging more women to enrol in science education. These policies are in line with the government's stand on admission which aims at making tertiary education accessible to all qualified students in order to achieve the goals of vision 2020.

5.3 SAP and Access to Tertiary Education

In assessing the impact of SAP on access to tertiary education, as many as 67.7% of the 96 respondents felt that SAP has created more avenues and increased access to tertiary education. This is regarded as a positive impact of SAP on tertiary education. Only about 15% of respondents thought that the impact of SAP on access to tertiary education has been negative. Another 15% claimed that there has been no concrete impact of SAP on access to tertiary education. Chapter nine examines the impact of SAP on some major programmes of the tertiary institutions. The point being stressed here is that the majority of the stakeholders acknowledge that SAP has had a positive impact with regard to increasing access to tertiary institutions.

Participants at the Focus Group Discussions conducted in all the sites confirmed this acknowledgement. Participants mentioned the opening of new polytechnics and the two new university institutions at Winneba (University College of Education) and in Tamale (University of Development Studies) as evidence of the positive impact of SAP on access to tertiary education.

Both participants and respondents, however, said that more could be done to further increase access to tertiary institutions. Respondents recommend the:
-	improvement and expansion of infrastructure and funding;
-	introduction of distance education;
-	employment of qualified staff; and
-	the introduction of a dual system (i.e. morning and afternoon sessions) as some of the means of increasing access to tertiary institutions.

Table 14 summarises the responses.

Table 14: Ways of Increasing Access to Tertiary Education

Ways	No	%
Improvement and expansion of infrastructure/funding	49	74
Introduction of distance education	12	18
Employment of qualified staff	4	6
Introduction of dual system (i.e. morning and afternoon sessions)	1	2
Total	96	100

5.4 The Concept of Quality Assurance in Tertiary Education

When the reform was initiated in the education sector in 1987, one of the critical concerns was the quality of education obtaining at all levels of the education system. Twelve years after the introduction of the reforms, however, the quality of education is seen to be still below expectations. Studies conducted into the pre-tertiary education by various researchers and organizations have confirmed that in spite of increased resource input into the education sector, the reforms have still been unable to raise quality at the pre-tertiary level.

As a result of these studies, some steps have been taken by the Ministry of Education and the Ghana Education Service (GES) to raise the quality of education at pre-tertiary levels. Examples of the steps taken are the Community School Alliances (CSA) Programme and the QUIPS programme, both of which encourage active community participation in the supervision of schools.

Unfortunately at the tertiary level, although there is much talk about falling standards in the academic performance of students, there has not been any systematic study of the state of education quality at that level. To evaluate the quality of education, it is not enough to look at the academic performance of students only. Academic performance in itself is the result of other factors of

educational quality assurance. These factors include the availability of teaching and learning materials (books, laboratories, computers etc.) and the presence of qualified and committed teachers.

Assessment of the quality of education should, therefore, cover the following components:

a) Inputs: teaching/learning materials (books, laboratory equipment, computers, research), introduction of market-driven programmes, qualified and committed staff (academic and support staff), motivated lecturers, financing and infrastructure development etc.

b) Process: effective teaching/learning process, effective supervision (lecturer/student ratio, cost-effectiveness of ratio before or after SAP), effective use of school time.

c) Output: academic performance and behavioural/attitudinal change.

The present study could not gather detailed information on these components, thus what is reported here is based on the accounts and views of the respondents and the participants.

5.5   Quality of Tertiary Education

The 60 tertiary institution authorities in our sample were asked for their views on the quality of tertiary education before and after the introduction of SAP. Over 61% of them could not give information on the lecturer/student ratio before the introduction of SAP. This is made up of 9 out of 14 Vice-Chancellors/Principals/Registrars and 28 out of 46 Deans/Heads of Department. Only 13 out of 60 respondents had an idea about the lecturer-student ratio and 12 of the 13 gave 1:40 as the lecturer-student ratio, while one respondent said the ratio was between 1:40 and 1:100. The non-response rate to this question was 16.7%.

It appears that more of the tertiary institution authorities were conversant with the lecturer-student ratio after the introduction of SAP. Forty-two out of 60 indicated

knowledge of the lecturer-student ratio after SAP. Out of this, 41 gave between 1:20 and 1:50 as the ratio while one respondent gave between 1:100 and 1:250 as the ratio.

As a result of the lack of knowledge about the lecturer-student ratio before SAP, it was difficult for the majority of the respondents to assess the cost-effectiveness of the lecturer-student ratio before and after SAP.

When asked to give their assessment of the overall quality of tertiary education after the introduction of SAP, 35 out of the 60 tertiary institution authorities claimed that there has been some moderate improvement; only three said that there has been significant improvement in the quality of education. Eight of them thought there had not been any improvement while 11 argued that SAP had rather brought deterioration in the quality of tertiary education. Four major reasons given by respondents to support their views were:

-- There has been an increase in access to tertiary education after SAP (20/60)

-- There is a lack of infrastructure to meet the needs of the growing numbers of students (10/60)

-- There is a lack of funds to acquire needed equipment and rehabilitate structures (10/60)

-- There is a general decline in annual subventions to tertiary institutions (4/60)

Participants of the FGDs were more emphatic on the quality of tertiary education. To them, quality has gone down due to the lack of lecturers, the poor conditions of service and poor facilities and. About 42% of the respondents think that SAP has not had any concrete impact on the quality of tertiary education. Another 24% think that the impact of SAP on quality education at the tertiary level has been negative. Only 28% believe that the impact of SAP has been positive. Table 15 summarises respondents' assessment of the impact of SAP on the quality of tertiary education.

Table 15: Impact of SAP on the Quality of Tertiary Education

Assessment of Impact	No	%
Positive	27	28.1
Negative	23	24.0
No concrete impact	40	41.7
Don't know	6	6.3
Total	96	100

5.6:   **Suggestions for Improving the Quality of Tertiary Education**

To improve the quality of tertiary education, the 60 tertiary institution authorities in our sample made the following suggestions:

--	Books, library materials, equipment/ facilities/logistics to be improved	32/60
--	Conditions of service for lecturers and support staff to be improved	15/60
--	Staff/student exchange programme to be encouraged	11/60
--	Lecturer-student ratio to be reduced	9/60
--	Information technology systems to make learning easier and enjoyable to be provided	5/60
--	Better qualified students to be enrolled	4/60
--	Regular review of curricula to be made	3/60

As can be seen, on top of the list of ways and means of improving the quality of education in tertiary institutions are: the provision of books, library materials, equipment and facilities (53%) and the improvement of the conditions of service for staff (25%).

In view of the emphasis placed on the provision of books, library materials, equipment and facilities and the improvement in the service conditions of staff and taking into account the components of quality education spelt out in section 5.4, it is justifiable to say that a positive impact of SAP on the quality of education at tertiary level is yet to be realised.

5.7   Conclusion

From the above information, the following conclusions can be drawn:

--   Ensuring gender equity/balance in enrolment to tertiary institutions is one of the paramount policies governing admissions to tertiary institutions. The rationale is to encourage more females to have access to tertiary education.

--   Access to tertiary education has increased since the introduction of SAP because more tertiary institutions have been established in the country.

--   The majority of respondents do not see any concrete impact of SAP on quality of tertiary education. FGD participants even think that SAP has had a negative impact on the quality of tertiary education. To them this situation is reflected in the: lack of lecturers, facilities/logistics, and lack of staff motivation in tertiary institutions.

--   Major ways to improve on quality of education in tertiary institutions as suggested by the respondents are: the provision of books, library materials, equipment and facilities and the improvement of the conditions of service for staff.

CHAPTER SIX

BUDGET, FUNDING AND COST RECOVERY
OF TERTIARY EDUCATION

6.1   Introduction

Generally, there have been increases in enrolment in tertiary institutions since the educational reforms began.   Yet, government expenditure on education has diminished in relative terms as stated in chapter three.   And while budget allocations to education have risen from ₡ 22.7 billion to ₡ 155 billion, their share as a percentage of GNP has fallen by international standards. Government spending on tertiary education has declined drastically during the period 1983–

1999. This chapter focuses on budgets, funding and the cost-recovery mechanisms open to tertiary institutions in the country.

6.2 Budget and Funding of Tertiary Education.

Mobilization of funds for the running of tertiary institutions has been one of the major constraints faced by the government and tertiary institutions in the country. Table 16 provides information on the types of constraint faced by institutions in fund mobilization as stated by the 60 tertiary institution authorities in our sample.

Table 16: Constraints faced by tertiary institutions in fund mobilization.

N = 60

Constraints	Frequency	Percentage
Delay in fee payment	32	53.3
Inadequacy of government subvention	19	31.6
Delay in government subvention	17	28.3
Non-adherence to proposed budget	4	6.6
Public perception of free education	3	4

Multiple choice

The table shows that delay in fee payment (53.3%), inadequacy of government subvention (31.6%) and delay in government subvention (28.3%) stand out as the major constraints faced by tertiary institutions in mobilizing funds.

6.3 Financial Support for Students

To identify the sources of financial support for students, all the tertiary institution authorities, students' representatives and government representatives in our sample were asked to indicate the sources of financial support open to students of tertiary institutions. Details of the sources are given in Table 17 below.

Table 17: Sources of financial support for students

N = 90

Source	1978–1983 Percentages	1984–1989 Percentages	1990–1994 Percentages	1995–1999 Percentages
Government	45	39.4	27.3	25.0

SSNIT	8	14.2	31.7	34.0
Parent/self	34	34.3	31.7	33.0
Tertiary institution	4	4.0	3.1	3.0
Foreign agencies	9	8.1	6.2	5.0

It is obvious from the table that the government was the major provider of financial support for students before the introduction of SAP (45.0%). Parents/self sources accounted for 34% of the financial support for students before the introduction of SAP, whilst SSNIT, development partners and the tertiary institutions accounted for 8%, 9% and 4% respectively by 1983. The situation, however, has changed since the introduction of SAP, thus shifting the financial burden of students on the SSNIT loan scheme (34.0%) and Parents/self (33.0%) as against the government (25%) between 1995 and 1999. Support from tertiary institutions themselves has been rather low and has not changed much over the period from 1978 to 1999. It is also interesting to note that support from development partners has been on the downward trend since the introduction of SAP.

With these trends, it may be inferred that the burden of financial support for students is shifting more and more on to the students and their parents themselves. Even where they take loans from SSNIT, this is to be repaid by the students (and at times their parents) after their studies. This finding is buttressed further by the fact that the financial assistance of tertiary institutions to students has never been adequate and has even been worse since the introduction of SAP, as the figures in Table 18 illustrate.

Table 18: Assessment of the institutions' financial support for students.

N = 90

Assessment	1978 – 1983 Percentages	1984 – 1998 Percentages	1990 – 1994 Percentages	1995 – 1999 Percentages
More than adequate	4.6	--	--	--
Adequate	5.8	9.1	7.9	9.1

Inadequate	19.3	25.0	43.2	76.1
Don't know	65.9	62.5	45.5	12.5
None	4.4	3.4	3.4	2.3
Total	100	100	100	100

A probe into the average amount of money available to students per semester showed that about two out of every five students of tertiary institutions have at least ₵ 1,000,000 each per semester. The mean figure for all 28 students in our sample is ₵ 544,034 per student per semester. Table 19 shows the distribution for the 28 student respondents. This finding seems logical because the SSNIT loan is currently ₵ 500,000 per semester.

A more important question was whether the amount of money available to the students per semester is adequate to cover their needs. As many as 71.4% of the respondents claimed that the money available to students per semester is inadequate. This finding confirms the complaints made by students of tertiary institutions since the inception of SAP and gives credence to their dissatisfaction with the SSNIT loan.

Table 19: Average student's money per semester.

N = 28

Average money per semester ₵	Percentage
Below 500,000	7.1
500,000 – 750,000	28.6
750,000 – 1,000,000	25.0
1,000,000 and above	39.3
Total	100.0

6.4   Cost Recovery of Tertiary Education

The policy of cost recovery by the tertiary institutions has been one of the concerns of the government since the introduction of SAP. This study therefore sought to find out the methods or strategies used by tertiary education institutions and the government to recover the costs of education. This question was put to the 60 tertiary institution authorities and the two government representatives in our sample. Table 20 gives a summary of the responses.

Table 20: Modalities for cost recovery.

Modalities	Number	Percentages
Spreading total expenditure on students as fees	19	30.0
Commercialisation of services rendered by school	14	22.6
Contribution from endowment fund	12	19.0
Don't know/ Refused to answer	17	27.0
Total	62	100

As can be seen from the table, payment of fees by students is the leading modality for cost-recovery by the tertiary education institutions. This is followed by commercialisation of services and contributions from endowment funds. It is worth noting that development partners support the current modality of fee payment because they believe that the government alone cannot bear all the costs of tertiary education. The development partners, however, stressed the need for the partners, the private sector and the tertiary institutions to join hands to help in recovering the cost of tertiary education. This position is worthy of serious consideration by both the government and the administration of tertiary institutions because more needs to be done to lessen the burden on students and their parents.

6.5   Parents' Ability to Pay Fees

With the exception of student respondents in our sample, all the respondents from tertiary institutions, the government and aid organizations were asked to assess

the ability of parents to pay for the education of their wards at the tertiary institutions. Table 21 gives a summary of the assessment.

Table 21: Assessment of Parents' Ability to Pay for Tertiary Education

Assessment	Number	Percentage
Very capable	01	1.5
Capable	17	25.0
Not capable	49	72.0
Refused to answer	01	1.5
Total	68	100

Seventy-two per cent of respondents felt that parents were incapable of paying fees for the education of their wards at tertiary level. A quarter of them felt parents are somewhat capable of paying fees. Only 1.5% of the respondents felt that parents are very capable of paying their wards education at the tertiary level.

The FGD participants also expressed the belief that parents are incapable of paying for tertiary education for their wards. According to the FGD participants, the meagre salaries given to the average worker makes it extremely difficult for parents to pay for tertiary education. They argued that the funding of tertiary education was originally borne by both government and parents but SAP has brought "cost-shifting", not cost-sharing to parents.   They also felt that government loans to students were inadequate. Participants, however, agreed that a more effective loan-recovery scheme was required make the SSNIT loan scheme meaningful and sustainable.

Participants further recommended that District Assemblies and communities should sponsor students and bond them to work for some period (2 – 5 years) for the sponsoring community/Assembly after school. Another suggestion was that student beneficiaries of community/Assembly sponsorship should in turn sponsor needy children as an alternative to community service. The Asanteman Education Fund was cited as a model for other regions. Yet another recommendation by

FGDparticipants was that civil servants should be levied ₵ 2,000 per month as a special education tax. Other ways of lessening the burden of fees on parents is to request, for instance, the Association of Ghana Industries (AGI) and the Ghana Chamber of Commerce to sponsor students in business studies, the Chamber of Mines to sponsor students in geology and the Electrictiy Corporation of Ghana to sponsor technicians.

CHAPTER SEVEN

HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT BY
TERTIARY INSTITUTIONS

7.1   Introduction

The literature review in chapter three, as well as the views of our respondents discussed in the previous chapter confirmed that SAP has caused a squeeze in the financing of the tertiary education sector. This squeeze has been felt in the area of recruitment and development of personnel in the tertiary institutions and has had adverse effects on research and research capacity building. In spite of these adverse effects, tertiary institutions continue to make serious efforts to ensure human capital development for the country. The new programmes introduced in the universities and polytechnics bear witness to this effort.

7.2   Human Resource Development for Ghana

Seventy-five per cent of the tertiary institution respondents said they have introduced a number of market-driven programmes since the introduction of SAP. The remaining 25 per cent have not taken any steps in that direction. Programmes introduced by the tertiary institutions since SAP include professional accountancy courses, agricultural sciences, integrated development studies and computer science courses or information management programmes.   These programmes were introduced to meet specific objectives. Table 22 lists the reasons given by tertiary institution authorities in our sample for the introduction of such market-driven programmes.

Table 22: Reasons for the Introduction of Programmes

N=60

Reasons	%
Demand from industry	61.7
Means of self-financing	38.0
Recommendation by the government	36.7
Means of attracting students	26.7
Recommendation by the World Bank	13.3
Recommendation by development partners	11.7
Means of justifying existing programmes	6.7

According to the authorities, demand from industry (61.7%) tops the list of the motivating factors for introducing the new programmes. The need for being self-financing comes next (38%). Government recommendation comes third (36.7%), whilst attracting students comes fourth (26.7%). World Bank recommendation and that from development partners are low on the scale of reasons for the introduction of such market-driven programmes. Since SAP has caused a squeeze in the financing of tertiary education, it is only prudent that institutions put more weight on market-driven courses rather than traditional programmes which have been criticised as being too academic and non-practical, and do not bring in the desired financial returns to the institutions.

In assessing the prospects for the programmes, 48.3% of the respondents touched on bright job prospects after school, whereas 33.3% of the respondents stressed the benefits of producing middle-level personnel for industry.

Institutions running these market-driven programmes have, however, encountered a number of problems. These problems include the lack of infrastructure and equipment, inadequate funding, lack of human resources to teach the courses and inability to obtain vacation attachment places in industry for students of the

programmes.   Table 23 lists these problems in the order as reported by respondents.

Table 23: Problems Connected with the Running of Market-Driven Courses
N=60

Problems	%
Inadequate infrastructural facilities/ equipment	45.0
Inadequate funding	38.3
Inadequate human resources	38.3
Inability of students to obtain attachment programmes	10.0

The table shows that inadequate infrastructural facilities and equipment, inadequate funding and inadequate human resources were the major problems confronting the tertiary institutions in the running of market-driven programmes. These problems should, therefore, be addressed immediately to enable more applicants to be enrolled in such market-oriented programmes, for they are more likely to attract financial assistance from industries and commercial organisations such as banks.

7.3   Human Resource Development of Tertiary Institution Staff

Improving the quality of tertiary education is impossible without the development of staff. Tertiary institutions are doing their best to improve the quality of their staff despite their decreasing resources. Members of the teaching staff are occasionally made to take internal or external courses or a combination of both in order to update their knowledge and skills.

Out of 51 respondents from the tertiary institution authorities who answered the question on training programmes undertaken by staff, 43 mentioned a combination of internal and external courses, whilst four each mentioned internal

and external courses respectively as the types of training programmes open to their staff. The costs of such training programmes are borne by any of the following organizations: universities/polytechnics, the government of Ghana, foreign organizations or staff members themselves.

Table 24: Sponsors of Staff Training Programmes

Sponsors	%
Government of Ghana	70.0
Staff's institution	50.0
Foreign assistance	41.7
Self (staff)	18.3

As shown in Table 24, the government (70%), tertiary institutions (50%) and foreign organisations (41.7%) in that order, are the main sponsors of academic staff training programmes.

On the question of how tertiary institutions attract and retain high calibre personnel, respondents claimed that the provision of soft loans for staff (50.9%), free medical care and accommodation were some of the main factors responsible for attraction and retention. Another factor that contributes to human resource development of the institutions is the promotion policy of the institutions. Members of staff are required to write and publish articles in reputable journals before they are promoted; 74% of the respondents confirmed this. The respondents, however, agreed that there has not been any significant change in the policies on staff attraction, retention and promotion since SAP was introduced. There is no indication either that the institutions would change these policies in the near future.

Another mechanism for quality control of teaching staff by the authorities of the tertiary institutions is staff assessment by students (49%) and annual assessment by heads of department (40%) respectively. Similarly, quality control of support staff is by annual assessment by heads of department, in-service training of staff

and part-time courses for higher qualifications. These policies, in a way, have a longer history than the structural adjustment programme. They have, however, been strengthened by the introduction of SAP conditionalities.

<div style="text-align:center">

CHAPTER EIGHT

DEVELOPMENT PARTNERS/NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANISATIONS (NGOs) AND TERTIARY INSTITUTIONS AFTER SAP

</div>

8.1   Introduction

Although in their operations, development partners and NGOs place emphasis on the development of basic education, they are equally involved, directly and indirectly, in the development of tertiary education in Ghana. This chapter seeks to capture the relationship between development partners/NGOs and tertiary institutions since the introduction of SAP.

8.2   Development Partners and Tertiary Institutions

The 60 authorities of tertiary institutions were asked to specify the type of assistance they have been receiving from development partners. The authorities listed a number of types of assistance received from dvelopment partners. These include:

Type				Percentage
Book acquisition	-	-	-	55.0
Scholarships to staff	-	-	-	35.0
Building/physical development		-		28.3
Funds for research (applied)	-	-		21.7
Scholarships to students		-	-	16.7
Funds for research (pure)		-	-	13.3
Book development	-	-	-	8.3
Endowment	-	-	-	-	3.3
No assistance	-	-	-	-	23.3

Book acquisition (55%), scholarships to staff (35%) and building/physical development (28.3%) top the list of types of assistance. Significantly, research – both applied and pure – and scholarships for students come as fourth, fifth and sixth on the list.

It is equally remarkable that assistance for book development and endowment funds, on which the institutions could draw for academic development, are very low on the list. Also significant is the fact that 23.3% of the respondents claim they have not received any assistance from development partners.

To cross-check this information, the six development partner respondents in our sample were requested to state the programmes or projects of tertiary institutions to which they provide assistance. Their list tallies with the one the tertiary institution authorities provided. These include: research (pure), research (applied), scholarships to staff and students, building/physical development and book acquisition. Indeed applied research, building/physical development and book acquisition are given priority assistance by the development partners, just as reported by the authorities of the institutions.

The need to promote the development of applied research and improve technical and science education were the main reasons for the support of such tertiary education projects. Pure research and scholarships to students take a secondary position on the list of assistance given to the tertiary institutions by the Development Partners. This gives credence to the suspicion that development partners have narrowed considerably their areas of assistance to tertiary institutions following the introduction of SAP. This may account for the growing dissatisfaction of the tertiary institutions with the relationship between them and development partners since the introduction of SAP.

Table 25: Assessment of overall relationship with development partners after SAP

Assessment	Number	Percentage

Satisfied	17	28
Not satisfied	25	42
Indifferent	11	18
No response	17	12
Total	60	100

As illustrated in Table 25 above, as many as 42% of the 60 tertiary education authorities in our sample expressed dissatisfaction with the current relationship between them and the development partners. Only 28% claimed that they were satisfied with the relationship.

Of those who expressed dissatisfaction with the relationship between their institutions and the development partners, 80% claimed that the development partners have not given them any assistance, while 12% reported that equipment supplied to them by development partners had been of inferior quality. Among those who expressed satisfaction with the relationship, 82% claimed that development partners had sponsored development projects in their institutions. Seventeen per cent of the same group reported that they were satisfied because their institutions had gained from book supplies to their libraries.

8.3   NGOs and Tertiary Institutions

NGOs have also been making some contributions towards the running of tertiary institutions in Ghana. According to the tertiary institution authorities in our sample, the types of assistance received from NGOs include:

Type				Percentage
Book acquisition	-	-	-	35
Building/Physical project	-	-	15
Research (pure)	-	-	-	6.7
Research (applied)	-	-	-	5
Scholarships to students	-	-	5
Scholarships to staff	-	-	-	5

Book development	-	-	-		5
Endowment	-	-	-	-	0
None	-	-	-	-	-	40

Though not much of assistance comes from the NGOs as the responses show, the list of assistance is similar to that given by development partners. Furthermore, book acquisition features as prominently among NGO assistance as it does among that of development partners. It is also interesting to note that 40% of the tertiary institution authorities in our sample claimed that their institutions have not received any assistance from NGOs since the introduction of SAP. It was, therefore, not surprising that only 13 of the 60 respondents expressed satisfaction with their relationship with the NGOs. Twelve of the thirteen confirmed that they have received "good assistance" from NGOs.

It is obvious that tertiary institutions have not gained much assistance from the development partners and NGOs since the introduction of SAP. Development partners and NGOs should, therefore, be encouraged to offer more and meaningful assistance to tertiary institutions to help them step up access and improve the quality of education in the tertiary sector. Some of the assistance they could give includes funds and/or equipment for book development and research projects.

CHAPTER NINE

SAP AND ITS IMPACT ON TERTIARY EDUCATION

9.1 Assessment of the Impact of SAP on Major Programmes of Tertiary Education

The previous chapters have looked at the contributions made by development partners and NGOs towards the development of tertiary education since the introduction of SAP. In this chapter, the focus is on the assessment of the impact of SAP on major programmes of tertiary institutions. In this connection, all the 96 respondents (including respondents from development partner agencies) were asked to react to a battery of questions that sought to elicit their views on the impact of SAP as well as their position vis-à-vis World Bank/IMF conditionalities regarding tertiary education.

As is to be expected, SAP is said to have had both a positive and negative impact, depending on the specific area of reference. Table 26 presents the assessments made by respondents.

Table 26: Respondents assessment of the impact of SAP on some major programmes of tertiary institutions

Impact of SAP on some areas of Tertiary Education			
Items	Positive Impact (%)	Negative Impact (%)	No Concrete Impact (%)	Don't Know (%)
Access	67.7	14.6	15.6	2.1
Quality assurance	28.1	24.0	41.7	6.3
Financing	12.5	41.7	39.6	6.3
Accommodation	7.3	46.9	41.7	4.2
Students' feeding	1.0	68.8	18.8	11.5
Student loans	51.0	17.7	24.0	7.3
Research	29.2	19.8	33.3	17.7

Personnel (academic)	40.6	18.8	31.3	9.4
Personnel (support)	44.8	16.7	30.2	8.3
Library facilities	43.8	16.7	31.3	8.3
Infrastructure development	25.0	29.2	44.8	1.0

The positive impact of SAP according to the respondents is in the areas of access to tertiary institutions (67.7%), student loans (51%), library facilities (43.8%) and support for academic (40.6%) and non-academic staff (44.8%). The negative impact of SAP was clearly noted in the areas of financing (41.7%), accommodation (46.9%) and students' food (68.8%). For the rest of the programmes, i.e. research and especially infrastructure development and quality assurance, respondents' views appear to be that no concrete impact has been made by SAP.

However, the overall assessment of the impact of SAP on tertiary education by all the respondents is that it has been positive (56.2%). Only about 22% felt that SAP has had a negative impact or no impact at all on tertiary education.

**Table 27: Overall assessment of the impact of SAP
on tertiary education**

Response category	No. of respondents	%
Positive	54	56.2
Negative	21	21.9
No impact	21	21.9
Total	96	100.0

9.2   Reasons for Assessment

Giving reasons for the overall assessment, 70.3% of those who said that SAP has had a positive impact on tertiary education cited the increase in student access to tertiary education as one clear instance of positive impact. About 22% pointed to the

improvement in facilities as another instance of the positive impact of SAP on tertiary education. Two of those who assessed the impact to be positive also cited as a positive factor the creation of awareness among stakeholders of the need to support tertiary educationis..

Among those who felt that SAP has had either a negative impact or no impact at all, 52% cited the non-improvement or deterioration of facilities in the tertiary institutions as their reasons for their assessment (Table 28).

Table 28:   Reasons for Assessments of the Impact of SAP on Tertiary Education

Overall Assessment	Increased access to tertiary education	%	Improve-ment in facilities	%	Facilities have not improved /deteriorated	%	SAP has reduced access to tertiary education	%	Responsibility has been shifted to parents	%	Awareness created for stakeholders to help	%	Quality of graduate students has declined	%	Total	%
Positive	38	93	12	67	-	--	-	--	1	25	2	100	1	20	54	56
Negative	2	5	2	11	11	50	2	50	3	75	-	--	1	20	21	23
No impact	1	2	4	22	11	50	2	50	-	--	-	--	3	60	21	23
Total	41	100	18	100	22	100	4	100	4	100	2	100	5	100	96	100

9.3   The World Bank/IMF and Tertiary Education

The launching of the ERP and SAP by the government was largely supported by the World Bank with co-financing by various facilities of the IMF. These include the Education Structural Adjustment Programme (EDSAP), Education Sector Adjustment Credit (EDSAC) I and II, other donor funds to be attracted in course of time and other concessional assistance.

Since all the stakeholders in our study have been exposed to these facilities and are familiar with the conditions attached to these World Bank and IMF loans, it became necessary to find out the respondents' reaction with regard to the future. They were asked to indicate whether or not they would support or reject the inclusion of various aspects of World Bank/IMF conditions in future development plans of Ghana's tertiary institutions. Their reaction on each item is put on the Likert scale of "strongly recommended", "recommended", and "not recommended" to "not at all recommended".

If we collapse the two scales of "strongly recommended" and "recommended" on the one hand to read "recommendation" and those of "not at all recommended" and "not recommended" on the other hand to read "rejection" we obtain the following recommendations/rejections.

i   Implementation of an acceptable student loan scheme (99%), control of student intake by tertiary institutions themselves (93%) and implementation of cost-recovery mechanisms (89%) top the list of recommendable World Bank /IMF conditions. ii   Procurement of materials through international competition, a contribution of 10% of the cost of tertiary education by communities and other stakeholders and the establishment of a mechanism for an annual review of expenditure with International Development Agencies (IDAs) also find favour with respondents. Compared with the top three, however, these conditions do not have strong support from the respondents.

iii   At the other extreme of the spectrum, World Bank/IMF conditions such as limiting the tertiary education share of the budget to 18% of the total education budget, control of intake by the government and staff reduction to 30% of the student population do not find much favour with the respondents. The figures are 82.3%, 71% and 68% respectively against the inclusion of such conditions in future plans.

Table 29:   Respondents' views on World Bank/IMF conditionalities

Conditionality	Strongly recommended (%)	Recommended (%)	Not recommended (%)	Not at all recommended (%)
Control of intake by government	6.3	22.9	49.0	21.9
Control of intake by institutions	52.1	40.6	5.2	2.1
Limitation of tertiary education share in the education budget to 18%	3.1	14.6	55.2	27.1
Implement action on cost-recovery mechanisms	40.6	47.9	8.3	3.1
Reduction of all staff to 30% of student population	10.4	21.9	54.2	13.5
Implement an acceptable student loan scheme	65.6	33.3	-	1.0
Procurement of materials through international competition	25.0	39.6	25.0	10.4
Contributions of 10% of cost of tertiary education by communities and other stakeholders	39.6	33.3	16.7	10.4
Establishment of a mechanism for annual review of expenditure with IDAs* (government to contribute 10% of cost)	30.2	39.6	15.6	14.6

*International development agencies

The implication of the data is that tertiary education institutions do not want to give up their traditional autonomy. This confirms the earlier findings that critics of the World Bank/IMF do not support the conditionality that the government should control the intake and enrolment of students. Again from the data, it can be said that the policy of cost recovery and cost sharing between stakeholders are policies that have come to stay. Finally, the idea of making communities

contribute 10% of the cost of tertiary education does not have strong support from the respondents.

CHAPTER TEN

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

10.1   Introduction

The concluding chapter pulls together the major findings of the study from the literature review, the survey and the Focus Group Discussions.

10.2   Findings from the literature review

-    The review revealed that as many as 10 (52.6%) of the 19 studies on SAP and tertiary education in this report were initiated by development partners/donors. Only two were initiated by the Ministry of Education. The rest were either initiated in collaboration with development partners or by research institutions, NGOs or individual researchers.

-    Ghana's education system before the introduction of the SAP was in near collapse and was dysfunctional in relation to the goals and aspirations of the country.

-    SAP was introduced to improve public sector management and in this particular context, rehabilitate the decaying education system.

-    The World Bank, however, put the emphasis on basic education, stressing that a large part of all resources given to education should be allocated to basic education. Meanwhile, the tertiary education share of total education resources was to be limited to 18%.

-    Government expenditure on tertiary education declined drastically during the period between 1983 and 1999. This was a result of the Structural Adjustment Programme, which caused a squeeze in the financing of the education sector in general.

-    Consequently, a system of cost sharing and cost-saving for financing tertiary education between government, students and the private sector was introduced as a major focus of the tertiary education sector reform.

-    The ultimate goal of the reforms was to make tertiary education more cost-effective and sustainable and thereby open greater access to and improve the quality of tertiary education.

- The impact of these measures, however, has been rather negative in that funding of education has suffered a decline in real terms as a consequence of a constrained fiscal environment.

- The conditions for sustainable quality improvement are not yet in place. This includes the implementation of effective financing of tertiary education, especially cost-sharing between government, students and other stakeholders.

- Although more tertiary institutions have been established following the reforms, intake in general and for women in particular has not kept pace with demand. Female enrolment continues to lag behind that of males. A comparative look at enrolment figures for the 1996-99 period showed a significant disparity in male/female enrolment ratios, in favour of males, at the tertiary level. At the three universities in Legon, Cape Coast and Kumasi respectively, the male/female percentage distribution of enrolment were as follows: 1996/97 session 68.9/31.1, 73.2/26.8 and 80.8/19.2; 1997/98 session 74.2/25.8, 73.1/26.9 and 80.3/19.7; 1998/99 session 70.4/29.6 73.8/26.2, and 79.8/20.2.

- Even though special education for the handicapped is one of the major concerns of the reforms, the review showed that special education at the tertiary level also suffers from the overall constraints that pervade the whole education sector.

10.3   Findings from the Survey and the FGDs

- Whereas as many as 78.1 per cent of all survey respondents claim that the implementation of the tertiary education reforms has been successful on the whole, implementation of the cost-sharing aspect has been rather difficult.

- Some of the factors that have constrained full implementation of the reforms include: lack of adequate funding, shortage of human and material resources and poor supervision of the implementation process.

- Tertiary institutions are positively disposed towards the establishment of distance education as a complementary delivery mode. Unfortunately, not much has been done in that direction.

- Many of the respondents and FGD participants agree that more tertiary institutions have been established in the country. This, in absolute terms, has contributed to an increase in access to tertiary education.

- A majority of survey respondents do not see any positive impact of SAP on the quality of tertiary education. FGD participants, however, think that SAP has had a negative impact on the quality of tertiary education. Major factors responsible for this situation are: lack of facilities/logistics, inadequate funding and lack of staff motivation in tertiary institutions

- Major ways to ensure a better quality of education in tertiary institutions as suggested by the respondents were: the provision of books, library materials, equipment and facilities and the improvement of the conditions of service for staff.

- As many as 75 per cent of authorities of tertiary institutions interviewed said they have introduced a number of market-driven programmes since SAP. These programmes include: professional accountancy courses, agricultural science, integrated development studies and computer science courses or information management programmes. Meeting the demand from industry has been the major impetus for the introduction of such programmes.

- Inadequate infrastructural facilities, inadequate funding and inadequate human resources were the major obstacles confronting the tertiary institutions in the running of these market-driven programmes.

- Dominant mechanisms for quality control of teaching staff by the authorities of tertiary institutions were staff assessment by students (49%) and annual assessment by heads of department (40%). Similarly, quality control of support staff is by an annual assessment by heads of department, in-service training of staff and part-time courses for higher qualifications. These policies, in a way, have longer history than the SAP.

They have, however, been strengthened by the introduction of SAP conditionalities.

- Delays in fee payment, the inadequacy of government subventions and delays in government's subvention stood out as the major problems faced by tertiary institutions in mobilizing funds.

- The government was the major financial supporter for students before the introduction of SAP. The situation has since changed. The financial burden of students has been shifted on the SSNIT loan scheme (92%) and parents/students (87.5%).

- Financial support from institutions for students proved to be woefully inadequate.

- Payment of fees by students is the main method of cost recovery of tertiary education.

- The World Bank and other development partners support the current policy of fee payment because they believe that the government alone cannot bear all the cost of tertiary education.

-- Out of 68 survey respondents who reacted to the issue of parents' ability to pay for tertiary education, 49 (72%) felt parents were not capable of paying for tertiary education. FGD participants also emphasised the inability of parents to pay for tertiary education for their wards.

- The idea of SAP generally seems good but its implementation has brought hardships, thus weakening the ability of parents to support their children in tertiary institutions.

- The positive impact of SAP has been felt in the areas of access to tertiary institutions, an increase in student loans and increased provision of library facilities. The negative impact of SAP has been experienced strongly in the areas of financing and cost sharing (41.7%), provision of accommodation (46.9%) and students' feeding (68.8%).

- Implementation of an acceptable student loan scheme, control of students' intake by tertiary institutions themselves and implementation of cost-recovery mechanisms top the list of recommendable World Bank/IMF conditions in future development plans.

- At the other extreme of the spectrum "limiting the tertiary education share of the budget to 18% of the total education budget", "control of intake by government" and "staff reduction to 30% of student population" as World Bank/IMF conditions does not find favour with the survey respondents.

- FGD participants raised the following concerns about the implementation of the tertiary education reforms:

  - SAP has weakened parents' ability to support their children in tertiary education. The participants were of the view that the meagre salaries of many workers make it extremely difficult for parents to pay for tertiary education.

  - Cost sharing should be based on parents' ability to pay

  - The quality of education has gone down and the impact of the reforms has not been felt in rural areas.

  - There is too much theoretical learning and too little practical training in tertiary institutions.

  - SAP has brought cost shifting and not cost sharing to parents.

- Participants agreed that District Assemblies and communities should sponsor students and bond them to work for some period (2-5 years) for the sponsoring community/assembly after school.

- Another recommendation from FGD participants is that the student (beneficiary) should also sponsor a needy child as an alternative to community service. Civil servants can be levied C2,000 per month as special education tax.

- Participants further stressed that the Association of Ghana Industries (AGI) and the Ghana Chamber of Commerce should sponsor students in Business Administration; the Chamber of Mines should sponsor students in geology and the Electricity Corporation of Ghana should sponsor technicians (among others) at the tertiary education level.

10.4   Recommendations

Consideration should be given to the following recommendations, bearing in mind observations and conclusions drawn from the study:

- Stakeholders should urgently address problems of funding and human resources availability to ensure proper implementation of the tertiary education reforms.

- Distance education as a complementary mode of tertiary education delivery should be taken seriously. The government, tertiary institutions and the private sector should put in more effort and resources into the establishment and operation of distance education programmes.

- Access to tertiary education should be backed by quality education. In this regard, the problems of facilities, logistics and funding, as well as the lack of staff motivation in tertiary institutions should be given urgent attention by all stakeholders.

- Government subventions should be increased to meet the challenges of tertiary education and should also be released on time to facilitate the smooth running of tertiary institutions.

- Tertiary institutions on their part should work harder to generate internal funds from research, consultancies and other services to supplement funds from government and other sources.

- The SSNIT loan scheme should be appraised with a view to making it sustainable.

- Communities and industries should be made to make meaningful contributions towards tertiary education because they benefit directly and indirectly from the products of tertiary institutions.

- The implementation of SAP has not been very successful. There is the need for a more Structural Adjustment agenda to be put in place for the country. Such structural policy/reforms should aim at improving quality, increasing efficiency and changing the output mix in the tertiary education sector.

- Parents' ability to pay for tertiary education should be considered seriously in the implementation of the cost-sharing package of SAP

- There is the need for tertiary institutions to place more emphasis on practical training rather than theoretical training. This calls for a review of the curricula of tertiary institutions so they become more practical. In addition, tertiary institutions should introduce more market-driven programmes to make education rewarding to the clients – students, the public and the private sector.

- It is important for stakeholders to consider the following as strategies for sourcing funds for tertiary education:

  - Communities should be made to sponsor students and bond them to work for a period of 2-5 years for the sponsoring community/assembly after school.

  - Students (beneficiaries) should sponsor needy children as an alternative to community service.

  - Civil servants should be made to pay at least 0.5% of their monthly salaries as a special education levy.

  - The Association of Ghana Industries (AGI) and the Ghana Chamber of Commerce should sponsor students in business administration, the Chamber of Mines should sponsor students in geology and ECG should sponsor technicians (among others) at the tertiary education level.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Ahadzie, William. (1999).   <u>State of Education in Ghana.</u>   Ghana National Education Campaign Coalition (GNECC). Pp.47-50.

Agyeman, D.K. et al. (2000).   <u>Review of Education Sector Analysis in Ghana, 1987-1998</u>. UNESCO/WEGSA

Bailey, Robert. W. (1987).   'Uses and Misuses of Privatization', in Steve H. Hanke (ed.), Prospects for Privatization (New York: Proceedings of the Academy of Political Science, 1987). Pp 151-52.

Daddieh, Cyril. (1995).   'Education adjustment under severe recessionary pressures: The case of Ghana' in, K. Mengisteab and B. Ikubolajeh Logan (eds.). <u>Beyond Economic Liberalization in Africa: Structural Adjustment and the Alternatives</u>. Zed Books. South Africa. Pp. 23, 40-51

Fobih, D. L.; Koomson, A.K.;
and Godwyll, E. F. (1993).   'The Case of Ghana' in <u>Formulating Education Policy: Lessons and Experiences from Sub-Saharan Africa</u>. France, Pp. 63-69

Foster, Philip. (1980).   'Education and Social Inequalities in Sub-Saharan Africa.' <u>The Journal of Modern African Studies</u>. 18 No.2. Pp. 201-36

Fredriksson, Ulf; Fumador, Alfred
and Nyoagbe, John. (1998).   The effects of structural adjustment on the education sector in Africa; with Ghana as case study. A Desk/Field study prepared for Education International, Ghana National Association of Teachers (GNAT), Teachers and Education Workers' Union (TEWU), Lararforbundet – Sweden Pp 9, 12, 15, 76.

Ghana. (1986).   'Report of Education Commission on Basic Education.' Accra. Preamble No. 4, P.iii.

Ghana Statistical Service. (2000) 2000 Population and Housing Census. Provisional Results.

Girdwood, Alison. (1999).   Tertiary Education Policy In Ghana: An Assessment: 1988 – 1999. Report for the World Bank. P. 13

Herbst, Jeffrey. (1993).   The Politics of Reform in Ghana, 1982 –1991. University of California Press, Berkley, Pp. 122.

Kwame Nkrumah University of
Science and Technology. (2000).   Basic Statistics. Planning Unit, KNUST Kumasi.

Ministry of Education. (1986).   'Education Commission Report on Basic Education'. Accra

Ministry of Education. (1994).   Education Reforms Programme: Policy Guidelines on Basic Education. Accra.

Ministry of Education and Culture, (1986).   The Educational Reform Programme Policy Guidelines on Basic Education.   Accra. Pp. 2-3, 5-10.

Samoff, J. with N'Dri, Therese
Assie-Lumumba et al. (1996).   Analysis, Agenda and Priorities for Education in Africa. Paris, UNESCO/WEGSA

Shiyan, Chao et al. (1998).   Assessing Basic Education in Ghana. The World Bank. (Africa Region).

Tripartite Information Team, Ghana Summaries of World Bank and Government of Ghana Documents on the Structural Adjustment and Economic Recovery Programme for the Structural Adjustment Participatory Review Initiative (SAPRI).   World Bank, Civil Society and the Government of Ghana. P. 67.

University of Cape Coast. (2000).   Basic Statistics Planning Unit, U.C.C. Cape Coast.

University of Ghana. (2000)   Basic Statistics. Planning Unit, U.G. Accra.

UNESCO. (1996).   The Development of Technical and Vocational Education in Africa. UNESCO office, Dakar, Senegal. p 92.

UNICEF. (1993).   Education Mid-Term Review. Accra.

University Rationalization Committee. (1987).   University Rationalization Study. Interim Report. Volume I. Ministry of Education and Culture, Ghana, Accra. P. 27.

University Rationalization Committee. (1988).   University   Rationalization   Study. Final Report. Volume II. Ministry of Education and Culture, Ghana, Accra. Pp. 4, 45.

White Paper on University Rationalization. 1991. pp60-61, 64-68.

World Bank. (1987).   'World Bank Development Report.' Washington, D.C.

SUMMARY OF LITERATURE ANNOTATION

Themes, Findings, Conclusions and Recommendations from the Reviewed Studies

The themes of the selected studies were analysed in the context of four broad headings/issue s:

1.   The state and future of tertiary education in the developing world

      i)   Funding of tertiary education in Ghana

      ii)   Exploring the future of higher education in the developing world.

      iii)   Higher education policy in the developing world.

      iv)   Role of African universities.

      v)   Problems of Higher Education and Training.

2.   Distance Education as a supplement of formal tertiary education

      i)   Distance Education.

      ii)   Avenue for further studies.

3.   SAP and Education in Africa

      i)   The state of Ghana's education before and after SAP.

      ii)   SAP and Human Resource Development.

      iii)   Effects of SAP on Education Financing.

      iv)   SAP and Gender inequity in tertiary education.

      v)   SAP and the Disabled.

      vi)   Community and implementation of SAP.

      vii)   Periodicals subscription under SAP.

4.   Development partners/donors and Education

      i)   Impact and influence of development partners/donors in the education sector.

      ii)   Education development in Africa.

Major findings of the studies

The major findings of the studies have been categorized under the themes listed above. Details of these findings are highlighted in appendix Ib (Literature Annotation). In this section, summaries of the findings extracted from the literature annotation are presented.

The State and future of tertiary education in the developing world

i) Funding of Tertiary Education in Ghana

Between 1988 and 1998, Government spending on tertiary education as well as expenditure on Full Time Equivalent (FTE) declined drastically. In spite of the decline in government expenditure, there was an 80% increase in enrolment in the tertiary institutions within the same period. The number of polytechnics in the country also rose from six to eight despite persistent and serious under-funding. At the same time, the students' loan scheme suffered a deficit of US$ 16 million.

ii) Exploring the future of higher education in the developing world.

It was observed that most developing countries' higher education system exhibits severe deficiencies. Developing countries are thus left with a formidable task of expanding their higher education system and improving quality, within continuing budgetary constraints. The problem of insufficient scientific capacity in developing countries was seen to be very acute but not insurmountable. It was also observed that the number of tertiary students per 100,000 inhabitants in Ghana declined from 144 to 126 between 1980 and 1990.

iii) Higher Education Policy in the Developing World.

Inappropriate policies in higher educational system have been identified as a factor leading to repetition, dropouts and waste in the higher education set-up. The studies further point out that as competition for resources and demand for tertiary education increase, the government will not be able to subsidize all programmes at a level that ensures quality and effectiveness. The extent of government involvement in finance, admissions and regulatory policies affects the quality, efficiency and innovativeness of higher education institutions.

iv) The Role of African Universities

It has been observed that in the medium term, the success of Africa's development efforts will be tied closely to the success of its universities. This has been attributed to the fact that individual universities in Africa generally play a larger and more influential role in national development than do universities in other parts of the world.

v) Problems of Higher Education and Training

The studies identified the following as the main educational problems in Africa today:

- Stagnation of enrolment and erosion of quality.

- Undermining of the contribution of higher education to development in Africa by factors such as the production of many graduates of programmes of dubious quality and relevance.

- High cost of higher education.

- Socially inequitable and economically inefficient patterns of financing higher education.

Distance Education as a supplement of formal Tertiary Education

i) Distance education

The following were the major findings of the study:

- There is a woeful lack of financial resources to support the project

- Logistics/facilities for the project are inadequate

- Commitment on the part of both the government and the universities is low.

ii) Avenue for further studies

The study found out that distance education as a non-conventional way of education, to a large extent, makes more efficient use of existing scarce resources and personnel. Its capacity to reach people in isolated areas increases access to education at a more cost-effective level.

SAP and Education in Africa

i) The state of Ghana's education before and after SAP

The structure and content of education in Ghana before SAP has been traced to the 1952 Accelerated Development Plan, which was the first time an attempt was made to implement a fee-free primary education for all.

The ERP and SAP came with prescriptions not only to make education more vibrant and viable but also to recover some of the costs of education to the government. However, the two programmes faced several problems including the lack of trained teachers, inadequate textbooks, poor supervision, low enrolment and high dropout rates.

ii) SAP and Human Resource Development

The study revealed that SAP has caused a squeeze in the financing of the education sector. This squeeze is seen as affecting expansion of access to education, especially at tertiary level, and has had adverse effects on research and research capacity building.

iii) Effects of SAP on Education Financing

Generally, there have been increases in the enrolment in tertiary institutions since the educational reforms were embarked upon under SAP. Yet, government expenditure on education has also fallen. The budget allocation to education, measured as a percentage of GNP, has been low by international standards.

iv) SAP and gender inequity in tertiary education

The enrolment of girls is of special interest. Enrolment ratios at the basic and secondary levels show that girls have lower enrolment rates than boys. The Ghana Living Standards Survey (GLSS III) enrolment profile indicates gender gap among all school-age children. The gap increases after age 11. On the average, age-specific enrolment rates for girls of primary school age are approximately 10% lower than those of boys of the same age group. The situation worsens as one moves from the basic, through secondary, to the tertiary

level. The For instance, in 1992, whereas the proportion of girls to boys at the basic level was 45:55 at the primary and 41:59 at the JSS, it was 22:78 at the tertiary level. There is also gender inequity at the regional level. According to Fredriksson (1998), data from the north show that the figures for enrolment in schools in northern Ghana are lower than the national figure for girls and worse than in the south despite the fact that obviously there have been improvements in the north over the years. Whereas the issue of female enrolment at tertiary level is of paramount interest, very little attention has been paid to it in the literature on tertiary education.

v)   SAP and the Disabled

Like the case of gender inequity, there has been dearth of studies on the disabled in tertiary education. It has been confirmed by the Special Education Division of the Ghana education Service (GES) that since the establishment of the Special Education schools over a period of 50 years now, only about 2,500 disabled children have had the opportunity of formal education up to the end of basic education.   Meanwhile, it is estimated that in 1996/97, there were about 430,000children aged between 6 and 14 with one form of disability or another. It can be inferred, therefore, that only a small fraction of the disabled that are being reached by basic education. The figure is worse at secondary and tertiary levels.

vi) Communities and Implementation of SAP

Urban communities with higher incomes have been more involved in the implementation of the education reforms than their rural counterparts. In terms of the provision of educational facilities, SAP could be said to have had a positive impact. Problems of high school fees, , high cost of living and high levels of unemployment and retrenchment have been seen as some of the adverse effects of SAP. These in turn have had adverse effects on the ability of communities to participate in the provision and maintenance of educational physical infrastructure.

vii) Subscriptions to periodicals under SAP

Ghanaian universities benefited greatly under SAP in terms of access to funds for subscriptions to periodicals. The prospects of sustainability of this access, however, seem dim.

Development partners/donors and education

i) Impact and influence of development partners/donors on the education sector.

The impact of donor interventions has been both positive and negative, but more negative in that funding of education has suffered a decline in real terms as a consequence of a constrained fiscal environment. Most donors believe that beneficiaries of tertiary education should be made to bear a substantial portion of the cost of their education.

ii) Educational development in Africa

The study identified two major reasons for the poor development of education in Africa.

- The ambivalence in many African states between the logic of decentralized management and the pressure of centralized control in educational administration.
- Poor qualifications and training of administrators and planners and the absence of a management information base for educational planning and administrative decision-making.

Conclusions

Based upon the summary of the literature reviewed under the four broad thematic headings, the following conclusions are worth making:

- Government spending on tertiary education as well as expenditure on Full-Time Equipment (FTE) declined drastically during the period under study.
- There has been an erosion of quality in the tertiary education system of many African countries.

- Even though distance education has the capacity to increase access to education, its expected benefits have not been realised because of the lack of financial resources and low commitment on the part of the government and the universities.

- SAP has caused a squeeze in the financing of the education sector. This squeeze has affected the expansion of tertiary sector education and has had adverse effects on research and research capacity building.

- The impact of donor interventions has been both positive and negative, but more negative in that funding of education has suffered decline in real terms as a consequence of a constrained fiscal environment.

Recommendations

The following recommendations based on the observations and conclusions made above, are worthy of note:

- There is the urgent need for alternative sources of funding to be identified and tapped for education in order to avoid further erosion of quality in tertiary education.

- The government and the universities must make distance education a priority to serve people who would otherwise not have access to education.

- The government should make education a top priority in development. Variables such as quality and internal efficiency, relevance, cost management, organization and planning should be factored in when education is considered.

- There is a need for further policy reforms in higher education to improve quality, increase efficiencyand change output mix, which may imply smaller intake in certain fields of study and relieve the burden on public sources of financing by increasing the participation of beneficiaries and their families.

ANNOTATED LITERATURE ON SAP AND TERTIARY EDUCATION IN GHANA

(1)

Title :	The Effects of Structural Adjustment on the Education Sector in Africa; with Ghana as case study
Author:	Ulf Fredriksson, Alfred Fumador and John Nyoabge
Years:	September 1996 – February 1997
Sub-sector:	Tertiary Education
Time of Publication:	10th July 1998
Scope:	Basic Education, Senior Secondary Education, Vocational Education and Tertiary Education
Theme:	The Effects of Structural Adjustment on the Education Sector in Africa in general and in Ghana in particular
Initiator of Study:	Education International; Ghana National Association of Teachers (GNAT) Teachers and Educational Workers Union (TEWU) – Ghana and Lararforbundet – Sweden
Executing Body:	Educational International Ghana National Association of Teachers (GNAT), Teachers and Educational Workers Union (TEWU) and Lararforbundet – Sweden
Objectives:	The study sought to: - - collect more information about the effects of structural adjustment on education at national level in order to present an in-depth case study; - start the process of formulating alternative strategies for the teachers' union on education and structural adjustment; and - increase awareness of the questions related to structural adjustment among member organizations through educational activities
Findings:	Among the findings are: - Ghana had some difficulties implementing what seems to be agreed policy in tertiary education related to cost sharing. The general idea is that the cost of accommodation should be taken over by parents and students. But how the cost sharing should be organized is still being discussed. In addition, the allocations to education in Ghana described as a percentage of GNP or as a percentage of total central government expenditure have been

fairly stable during the 1980s and 1990s. However, this does not mean that the amount of money in real terms invested in education has been equally high during the whole period. Furthermore, there have been increases in enrolment in tertiary institutions since the educational reforms began under SAP.

It can also be noted that, in spite of a fairly high allocation within the central government budget, the allocation to education measured as a percentage of GNP is low by international standards.

Conclusions: The development in the education sector can be described both in terms of success and failure. This includes the increase in enrolment at all levels of education. Of special interest is the enrolment of girls. As of 1992, female enrolment stood at 22 per cent. However, the question related to the quality of education students receive has not been resolved.

Recommendation: It is recommended that:
- The implementation of structural adjustment policies should be slower and that the policies need to be designed to protect vulnerable groups in society.
- Salaries should be set at a level that will permit workers to survive.
- If the adjustments are meant to improve the living conditions of the population, then it is imperative that there must be a consensus about measures. the government, civil society and all stakeholders should be involved in the discussion.
- In the field of education, the views of parents, teachers and other stakeholders should be considered in order to shape and review the education policy.
- There should be a national debate on the financing of education. The central government should take care of tuition costs at all levels and the provision and maintenance of equipment and facilities at secondary and tertiary levels.
- There should be a 30% to 50% increase in student loans and scholarships should be considered.

Relevance of Study: Directly relevant

(2)

Title:	The Development of Human Resources within the Context of Structural Adjustment and Transition. The Educational Sector: A State-of-the-Art Report on Anglophone West African – Ghana, Nigeria, Sierra Leone, Liberia and The Gambia.
Author:	Prof. Dominic Kofi Agyeman
Year:	1992
Sub-sector:	The entire spectrum of education
Theme:	On–going reforms in education as the hub of the development of Human Resources within the context of Structural Adjustment Programme and Transition in Anglophone West Africa
Scope:	First, second and third level of schooling, Adult and Non-formal Education
Initiator:	ERNWACA
Findings:	- Positively, the first level of education has seen structural, curricular, management and administrative changes. The net effect of the changes has been the reduction of of the length of education from 20/21 years to 15/16 years, which implies a cost reduction.
	- Negatively, the Structural Adjustment Programme has caused a serious squeeze in the financing of the education sector. This has affected the expansion of access, especially, at the third level and has had adverse effects on research and research capacity building.
Recommendations:	- The success of educational reforms and the ability to develop human resources in these anglophone countries depend on the ability to find alternative sources of funding from the first to the third levels of education.
	- Community participation promises to be a favourable alternative source at the basic education level and in the non-formal sector. The practice should be stretched to cover the second and third levels of education.
	- To win the confidence, sympathy and support of the community, the universities and colleges should diversify their curricula and research activities to make them more relevant and community-oriented. This would also make education and research more development-oriented and cost-effective.
Relevance:	Directly relevant

(3)

Title:	Higher Education in Developing Countries: Peril and Promise
Author:	The Task Force on Higher Education and Society. The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/The World Bank
Year:	2000
Sub-sector:	Higher Education
Initiator:	The World Bank
Theme:	Exploring the future of higher education in the developing world. To diagnose specific problems that are common across the developing world and suggest potential solutions, concerning higher education development.

Scope:
- Higher education's longstanding problems and the new realities it faces;
- The nature of the public interest in higher education;
- The issue of how focusing on higher education as a system will yield the benefits of planned diversification;
- The need to improve standards of grievances;
- The particularly acute requirement for better science and technology education; and
- A call to develop imaginative, general education curricula for certain students.

Findings:
- In most developing countries, higher education exhibits severe deficiencies, with the expansion of the system as an aggravating factor. Developing countries are left with a formidable task – expanding their higher education system and improving quality, all within continuing budgetary constraints.

- Subordination to government pressures or short-term political considerations will not create a system of higher education that serves the long-term interest of the public.

- Policy makers must decide on the extent to which they will guide the development of their country's higher education sector and the extent to which they think market forces will lead to the establishment and operation of village systems.

- Good governance promotes educational quality; and it is recognized that traditions of governance vary from country to country, and by type of institution.

- The problem of insufficient scientific capacity in developing countries is acute, but it is not insurmountable.

- The number of tertiary students per 100,000 inhabitants in Ghana declined from 144 to 126 between 1980 and 1990.

Recommendations: Funding – mixed funding model to maximize the financial input of the private sector, philanthropic individuals and institutions, and students.

Resources – more effective use of physical and human capital

Better management will lead to more effective deployment of limited resources

Curriculum development, especially in two contrasting areas: science and technology, and general education.

Relevance to the study: Direct

(4)

Title:	Education in Sub-Saharan Africa: Policies for Adjustment Revitalization and Expansion
Author:	The World Bank (World Bank Report)
Year:	1989
Sub-sector:	All levels of education
Initiator:	The World Bank
Theme:	Investment in education and training in 39 African Countries

Objectives:

   (i) Identify and describe common problems and issues of education development in Africa

   (ii) To provide leaders in each country with comparative data and analytical tools for developing their own policies and priorities

   (iii) To suggest specific policy directions for consideration by national educational authorities and by donors

Scope: Educational development in Africa: pre- and post–independence; policy framework; policy options by level of education: primary education, secondary education and training, higher education; the role of the international donor community; the expected benefits of education.

Findings:

   (i) The main educational issues in Africa today are the stagnation of enrolment and the erosion of quality.

   (ii) Adjustment to current demographic and fiscal realities, though difficult, is essential if the disruptive effects of these external factors are to be minimized in the years ahead.

   (iii) Revitalization of existing educational infrastructure is the second dimension of a properly conceived educational strategy.

   (iv) Higher education's contribution to development in Africa is being threatened by four interrelated weaknesses:

       (a) Higher education is now producing relatively too many graduates of programmes of dubious quality and relevance and generating too little knowledge and direct development support;

       (b) The quality of these outputs shows unmistakable signs in many countries of having

deteriorated so much that the fundamental effectiveness of the institutions is also in doubt;

(c) The cost of higher education is needlessly high;

(d) The pattern of financing higher education is socially inequitable and economically inefficient.

Recommendations: (1) Adjustments to take two forms; (a) Diversifying sources of finance, and (b) unit cost containment .

(2) Revitalization: (a) renewed commitment to academic standards, principally by strengthening examination systems, (b) greater investment in operation and maintenance of physical plant and equipment

(3) Policy reform in higher education; (a) to improve quality; (b) to increase efficiency; (b) to change the output mix, which may imply smaller intake in certain fields of study; and (d) to relieve the burden on public sources of financing by increasing the participation of beneficiaries and their families.

(4) International donor community support – (a) seed money to cover both local and foreign costs of developing policies and improving management; (b) provide ready access to the ongoing experience of other countries in formulating and implementing policy reform; (c) establish and finance a source of high-quality specialized technical expertise without direct financial or political ties to any government or international donor.

Relevance to the study: Direct

(5)

Title:	Education in Sub-Saharan Africa: Policies for Adjustment, Revitalization and Expansion.
Author:	Peter R. Moock and Ralph W. Harbison.
Year:	1998
Year of study:	1987.
Sub-sector:	Tertiary
Theme:	Movement towards adjustment, revitalization and expansion (Seminar report).
Scope:	Primary education, secondary education, distance education, technical and vocational education, and tertiary education.
Initiator:	World Bank.
Executing body:	World Bank.
Type of literature:	Research report

Objectives:

- To identify and describe common problems and issues of educational development in Africa
- To provide leaders in each country with comparative data and analytical tools for developing their policies and priorities
- To suggest specific policy directions for consideration by national education authorities and by donors
- Encourage structural adjustment in the education sector.

Findings: Higher education's contribution to development in Africa is being threatened by four interrelated weaknesses:

- Higher education is now producing relatively too many graduates of programmes of dubious quality and relevance and generating too little new knowledge and direct development support
- The quality of these outputs shows unmistakable signs in many countries of having deteriorated so much that the fundamental effectiveness of the institutions is also in doubt
- The cost of higher education is very high (where cost is measured in terms of output forgone)

Conclusions:	Wherever the weaknesses are found in higher education (tertiary), policies should seek to:

- Improve quality
- Increase efficiency
- Constrain output, especially in those fields that do not directly support economic development, and
- Relieve the burden on public sources of financing by increasing the participation of beneficiaries and their families.

These will require analytical and planning capabilities that are generally in limited supply and exceedingly scarce in some countries. Political considerations will inevitably limit the feasibility of some desirable elements and sequences of measures. In addition, actual implementation will demand a level of managerial competence that is uncommon. Also, very little can be expected to happen quickly, for institutional changes of the required magnitude are always excruciatingly slow. Great persistence will be needed.

Recommendations: In view of the fact that the recent deterioration threatens the ability of most of Africa's institutions of higher education to contribute to the region's development, the quality of these institutions must first be restored and then improved so that the region can extract maximum advantage for its own purposes from accelerating worldwide advances in science and technology.

- Some tertiary institutions, individual campuses, academic departments and teaching programmes need to be amalgamated into larger units of economically viable size.
- Personnel reductions, especially of non-teaching staff, are recommended in some countries but should be sought in such a way as to increase the average level of relevant training and experience of those who remain, particularly those in academic positions.
- The number of students at most institutions needs to be stabilized by tightening admission and performance standards and by eliminating free room and board. The inequitable effect of this measure can be mitigated by the provision of scholarships based on need.
- The study urgently recommends that each African nation should embrace the task of formulating and implementing an internally coherent set of policies that reflects the nation's unique history and aspirations and that effectively addresses its specific problems in the education and training sector.

Relevance: Direct

(6)

Title:	Tertiary Education Policy in Ghana. An Assessment: 1988-1998.

Author: Alison Girdwood.

Year: 1999.

Coverage: Tertiary education.

Theme: Assessment of tertiary education policy in Ghana: 1988-1998

Scope: The entire country.

Initiator: World Bank.

Executing body: World Bank.

Objectives: It was anticipated that the project's primary impact would be that of an improvement of quality in the processes of teaching and learning. More broadly, its development objectives were designed to reflect those of the government's own policy agenda, namely:
- To reverse system deterioration, falling standards, and the declining quality of education
- To expand access to tertiary education
- To establish a stable and sustainable basis for the financing of tertiary eduaction; and
- To create institutional capacities for quality monitoring and policy evaluation in the tertiary education sector.

Findings:

- Government spending on tertiary education actually declined by one-fifth of the former proportion of educational expenditure, dropping from 15% of the education budget to 12% for much of the period under study.
- Expansion of students' numbers however was rapid (an 80% increase in enrolment over the duration of the project).
- The number of polytechnics rose from six to eight (and was projected to rise to 10), despite persistent and serious underfunding.
- Expenditure on Full-Time Equivalent (FTE) students fell from an average of almost US$2,500 a year per university student in 1990, to approximately US$900 in 1997; and from US$180 a year in the polytechnic sector (already a matter of concern) to about US$74 in 1997.

- The student loan scheme had generated a deficit of US$16 million for the public purse (with no apparent equity benefits), and its conditions for viability had not yet been addressed.

Conclusion: While many of the initial policy agreements of the tertiary education project have not yet been achieved, considerable progress has been made over the last 10 years with the Ghanaian tertiary education sector, particularly in view of the constraints experienced. Many of the factors impeding implementation appear to have been related to the nature of the political process in Ghana, in particular the ability or otherwise of two successive governments (and several Ministers of Education) to accept and sustain the political risk necessary to achieve policy outcomes.

Other factors included ambivalence and/or ambiguity over the primary goals of reforms, and thus over trade-offs and levels of expenditure necessary to achieve desired policy objectives (leading to an inability to prioritise means and ends sufficiently).

Finally, the weak public sector environment has made the management of effective educational reforms impossible.

Recommendations:
- The need for the government of Ghana to ensure a greater allocation of funding to enrolment, whilst still seeking to promote equity.
- The need for the introduction of a more dynamic and non-traditional approach to student financing.
- A range of options for student financing should be made available to students from different backgrounds.
- Polytechnic education should be a major focus of future investment in Ghana.
- There is the need to ensure potential mobility between institutions and sub-sectors, and accreditation of work-based learning.

Relevance: Direct

(7)

Title:	Periodicals Subscription under Structural Adjustment in Ghanaian University Libraries: An Appraisal.
Author:	Richard Arkaifie.
Year:	1997.
Sub-sector:	Tertiary education
Theme:	An appraisal of periodicals subscription under the Structural Adjustment Programme in Ghanaian university libraries.
Initiator:	R. Arkaifie

Objectives: To assess the general situation in Ghana before SAP.

- Identify measures taken in resolving the crisis in the ordering of periodicals to sustain academic work.
- Identify benefits derived from the introduction of SAP with regard to periodicals subscription in Ghana.
- Consider the extent to which funding under the programme has solved the problems relating to the elimination of gaps created in the periodicals' holdings of the libraries.
- Consider the sustainability of Ghanaian libraries after the SAP

Findings: Ghanaian universities benefited greatly under SAP

- The Health and Education Rehabilitation Project, Credit 1953GH, a project made feasible under structural adjustment made it possible for Ghanaian universities to pay for the subscriptions for a sustained period of three years. The Educational Sector Adjustment Credit (EDSAC) also provided money annually for subscriptions. There were, however, problems associated with the management of the second grant. Prominent among them was the late release of funds, even when subscriptions had lapsed thereby creating further gaps.
- The prospects for sustainability under SAP are dim.

Conclusion: Much has been gained under the structural adjustment programme.

Recommendations:

- Subscription to periodicals for a guaranteed period spanning a number of years is to be preferred to an annual subscription that could easily result in gaps when payments are not made in good time in the preceding year.
- Governments should make a special allocation to institutions for books and periodicals.

Relevance of study: Direct

(8)

Title: Education Sector Strategy

Author: The World Bank Group EE30 Human Development Network

Year: 1999

Coverage: All educational sectors

Initiator: The World Bank

Type of study: World Bank Report

Objectives:

- To take stock of key changes in the world today and implications for education
- Vision of education in the new millennium
- Describe the rich group of partners in the education endeavour
- How the Bank's role has evolved.

The above listed objectives set the context for the strategy that is now guiding activities and setting principles in the education sector.

- To describe the Bank's global priorities and programmes to help countries progress toward international education goals and improve the quality of teaching and learning
- To describe the processes and operating principles that will help Bank staff to contribute more effectively to better education outcomes in each client country and to monitor success in implementing this strategy.

Findings: Much progress has been made in enrolment in developing countries. Three-quarters of all children in developing countries now attend school compared to just half 30 years ago. But much more progress is needed.

Serious challenges remain. Access has faltered or declined in some countries, notably in sub-Saharan Africa, where enrolment increases have not kept pace with population growth, especially with regard to females, minorities and the poor who are disproportionately excluded.

There are enormous disparities in education across and within countries. Thus, there is no simple prescription for what countries can do to progress towards the long-term goals of universal access

to good quality basic education and the opportunity to acquire advanced skills.

Conclusion: The Bank can draw on 35 years of experience in education resulting from almost 600 projects in 115 countries funded with a total of US$26 billion.

Recommendations: Renewed progress in education clearly requires strong, productive partnerships between governments, NGOs, and local stakeholders with the support of bilateral and multilateral development agencies.

- The Bank wishes to use its comparative advantage which lies in its ability to bring together a wide range of stakeholders, offer access to finance, provide objective advice, employ a multi-sectoral approach, sustain a long-term commitment, and share knowledge drawn from around the world.
- There should be shift in emphasis and commitment from hardware (civil works and equipment) to software (training, technical assistance, books and system reforms).

Relevance: Indirect

(9)

Title:	Improving Higher Education in Developing Countries
Author:	Angela Ransom, Siew-Mum Khoo, Viswanathan Selvaratnam
Year:	1993
Coverage:	Higher education
Sponsor:	Economic Development Institute of the World Bank
Type of study:	Seminar report

Objectives:

- To solicit comments on crucial issues raised in a series of papers analysing important issues in higher education
- To obtain information on country experiences in resolving problems in the higher education sector
- To widen the analysis and understanding of possible policy options for the World Bank's research and lending programmes aimed at sustaining higher education development
- To help the World Bank develop better policies through sharing ideas and experiences across a wide range of countries.

Findings:

- In situations of excess demand for education, higher education initiatives use access policies to select the most qualified candidates. This is to reduce overcrowding through rationing places according to specific criteria and to give underrepresented or disadvantaged groups equal opportunity. The choice of access policies has implications for quality and efficiency. Inappropriate selection policies produce repetition, dropouts, and waste.
- The current situation in most developing countries of free or below cost higher education, irrespective of private or societal returns, produces inefficiencies and inequity. As competition for resources and demand for places increase, governments will not be able to subsidize all programmes at a level that ensures their quality and effectiveness.
- The degree of government involvement in finance, admissions, and regulatory policies affect the quality, efficiency, and innovativeness of higher education institutions.
- Changes in international economic structures due to new development processes based on technology make it imperative for developing countries to build up their knowledge base in scientific and technological fields.

- Universities should be held accountable for their efforts and outcomes in terms of the costs and benefits of their programmes.

Recommendation:

- To promote quality and the best use of resources, admissions policies must be fair and be based on candidates' merit and ability to benefit from higher education. Access policies must also encourage institutions to respond to the demand for different types of higher education by different social and ability groups, and to recognise and react to labour market signals.
- Available resources will have to be invested where they produce the most cost-effective results in terms of teaching and research. Higher education institutions will have to come up with strategies for reducing their exclusive reliance on public financing of higher education.
- Considering the crucial role of the state in most higher education systems in developing countries, government regulation must promote institutional autonomy, flexibility, and innovation to support improved quality.
- With limited research funds, countries need viable national science and technology research policies to help set priorities, determine their comparative advantage, choose between different fields and disciplines, and foster links between university research and development and that done by the private and public productive sectors in order to derive full economic and social benefits from technological innovation.
- Governments and international funding bodies need to know how well universities use their physical and financial resources and how well they serve the labour market and economic development.

Relevance: Indirect

(10)

Title: Survey on Distance Education in Ghana

Author: Commonwealth of Learning

Year: 1992

Sub-sector: All levels of education.

Initiator: Ministry of Education

Theme: Distance education as a way of offering greater opportunities to people who require further studies.

Scope: Distance Education in Ghana: Initiatives for distance education in the universities and other institutions, including the KumasiInstitute of Tropical Agriculture (KITA), Home Study Centre, the Rapid Results College, Ghana Institute of Journalism, International Correspondence Schools, Media Houses, Trades Union Congress, Pupil Teachers' Modular Course, Ministry of Health and Kumasi Advanced Technical Teachers College (KATTC).

Objectives:

- To identify existing distance education programmes in Ghana.
- To evaluate the educational value of distance education programmes.
- To classify the type of education each programme provides.
- To identify various learning needs that exist in Ghana and that can be satisfied through distance education.
- To suggest the most relevant programmes in terms of national aspirations and needs.
- To identify the most appropriate technology and techniques to initiate and sustain the programmes.
- To prepare a phased and costed programme and identify possible sources of funding; and
- To make suggestions and recommendations for action.

Findings: The main motivation for distance education in Ghana emanate from the basic constraints in the education system. These constraints are financial, human resource and public will, among others. They inhibit good quality and access of education to a greater number of people. Distance education as a non-conventional way of education, to a large extent, makes more efficient use of existing scarce

resources and personnel. Its capacity to reach people in isolated areas increases access to education and also offers training to disadvantaged groups. It democratizes educational provision.

Conclusion: Distance education is a non-conventional way of education than can increase access to education tremendously if the bottlenecks are removed.

Recommendations:

- Government and universities must make distance education a priority to serve a population who would otherwise not have access to education.
- Funding must be sought to establish a Distance Education Unit.
- Core positions must be created in both professional and support categories to meet the academic needs of students and instructors.
- A quality Distance Education Unit that can develop and maintain performance in three dimensions: efficiency and effectiveness, capacity and sustainable.

Relevance: Directly relevant (Policy Document).

(11)

Title:	Ghana Distance Education Development Project
Authors:	UNESCO Consultants: Dr. A.A. Kwapong, Dr. Collin Yerbury, Mr. Reuben A. Aggor, Dr. K. A. Awuku, Mr. D. Y. Owusu.
Year of Study:	1994
Theme of Study:	A Review of Distance Education Needs in Ghana as a contribution to the Reform of the Tertiary Education System.
Sub-Sector:	Tertiary Education
Coverage:	Distance Education at the tertiary level, namely, universities and university colleges, polytechnics and regional colleges of applied arts, science and technology.
Type of Literature:	Policy Document.
Initiator:	Ministry of Education in Consultation with UNESCO.
Executing Body:	Ministry of Education.
Objectives:	The main objective of the project was to review all documents on distance education so as to remove any bottlenecks inhibiting the operation of the system at tertiary level. The essence was to use distance education as a major option to meet the demand for and access to higher education and to reduce costs, both for the government and for students and their families.

Findings:

The following were the major findings of the project:
- There was a woeful lack of financial resources to support the project.
- Logistics/facilities for the project were inadequate.
- Commitment on the part of both government and the universities was low.

Recommendations:

Three sets of recommendations were made. The first was for the government while the other two were for the universities. For the government, the project recommended that:
- A National Council for Distance Education should be established.
- A National Distance Education Secretariat (NDES) should be established to avoid unnecessary duplication and ensure optimum use of limited resources.

- The secretariat should be headed by a suitably qualified senior academic and each university should establish a distance education centre to be responsible for organising and implementing distance education programme in that institution.
- The government and the universities should make maximum use of existing resources and facilities throughout Ghana.
- The government should provide adequate financial resources and suitable buildings and other physical facilities to accommodate each distance education centre and the National Distance Education Secretariat (NDES).
- The government, with the support of donor agencies, should construct learning centres that are well stocked with books, computers, science equipment and other educational resources in regional and district capitals to serve as learning resource centres for post-secondary education.

For the universities, the project recommended:
  - That the distance education centres should be provided with adequate financial, physical and human resources to carry out their mission effectively.
  - That in these critical financial times for Ghana, maximum use be made of all available resources.
  - That the universities should form inter-university committees on programme discipline areas of common interest and develop a credit transfer system, enabling distance education students to take courses and programmes from any of the institutions and obtain credit.
  - That the distance education centres should adopt a team approach in the planning, design and production of distance education courses and programmes.
  - That the first courses should be based on existing course materials, prepared for use elsewhere, with the necessary adaptation, rather than writing entirely new courses, ab initio.
  - That the National Distance Education Secretariat (NDES) and each distance education centre must have a programme for monitoring, evaluating and research.
  - The second set of recommendations to the universities enjoins them to select suitable course materials prepared by other tertiary institutions. If suitable course materials are not available or if courses are unique to the Ghanaian education system, the universities should initiate their development, design, writing and production. The recommendations also enjoin the authorities to ensure that course writers and

instructional staff should be paid adequate remuneration and courses shall belong to academic departments.

- Also, the NDES and the university distance education centres should establish and maintain close collaboration with various international organisation

Relevance: Direct

(12)
Title: Implementation Completion Report: Republic of Ghana Tertiary Education Project (Cr 2428- GH)

Author: The World Bank. Report No. 19048

Year: 1999

Subsector: Tertiary

Theme: The Bank's role in the Sector

Initiator: The World Bank

SCOPE: I
- PROJECT OBJECTIVES AND COMPONENTS
- Credit Covenants and Special Agreements
- Evaluation of Project Objectives
- Assessment of Project's Success and Sustainability
- Analysis of key factors affecting major objectives.

Findings:
- Broad consultation and institutional participation is essential not only in project design, but also continuously throughout the implementation of the project. This implies higher supervision costs.
- Managed expansion of tertiary enrolment is absolutely critical for maintaining educational quality, yet political circumstances often make it difficult for governments to exercise this control – even when bound to do so by legal covenants in the Credit Agreement.
- It has proven difficult for the finance arm of government to recognize and affirm education sector and institutional priorities in the allocation of public resources.
- Bank staff recognizes the potential of tertiary students to stalemate processes of tertiary reform, particularly with regard to financial issues such as cost sharing, student privileges, student loans, and scholarships.
- The introduction of computerized management information systems was a "pioneering" experience in Ghana.
- Research funds should be managed by an institution, by project implementation unit or parent ministry
- Research proposals should be invited from university departments rather than from individuals.

Recommendations:

- Total recurrent expenditure per student is recommended as a main performance indictor for monitoring the balance between enrolment growth and the capacity to finance expansion without loss of quality.
- Mechanisms for continuous communication and consultation with student representatives should be explicitly incorporated in project design.
- Technical evaluators of research proposals should be paid enough to ensure timely responses.
- Short term and in-service training in professional management techniques for staff at all levels of management should be a continuous activity throughout the life of any higher education project.

Relevance: Direct

(13)

Title:	Educational Reforms and Community Response in the Context of the Structural Adjustment Programme: The case study of Rural Mepom and Koforidua Municipality.
Author:	Godwin R.K. Egbenya.
Year:	1995
Sub-sector:	J.S.S.
Theme:	Measures of the 1987 Educational Reforms (J.S.S. level) and community response in the implementation of the measures, within the context of S.A.P.
Scope:	How far the measures have gone in solving the problems of the old educational system in the selected rural Mepom and urban Koforidua, using sampled parents of J.S.S students, their teachers and graduates of the J.S.S.

Findings:

- Reforms have not achieved the desired results because, apart from the medium level of benefits recorded; the levels of supply of school items were medium and low for the rural and urban areas of study respectively.
- The extent of a community's response or participation in the execution of the reforms could be determined by the income of that community. Thus the urban community, which had higher income, was more involved in the implementation of the reforms than its rural counterpart.
- SAP made some positive impact by way of supply of educational facilities.
- Problems of high school fees, high cost of education, high cost of living, and high level of unemployment were also recorded with the introduction of the reforms.

Recommendations:

- Intensify education of the community on the need for their involvement in the upkeep of schools. Also, schools should be encouraged to carry out projects in the community that would make the people interested in helping the schools.
- Government should encourage private firms to create trade schools where the J.S.S. graduates would continue with the pre-vocational and technical skills to prepare them fully for self-employment in both the rural and urban areas.

- Teachers should be paid adequately. Success of educational reforms depends on them to a large extent.
- Pupils should be made to take a Common Entrance Examination for entry into J.S.S. This is called the National Primary School Examination in Sierra Leone.

Relevance: Indirect

(14)
Title: The Role of Donors in Education in Ghana: An Appraisal

Author: Center for Public Interest Law [CEPIL]: Dominic Ayine, Charles
                Ayamdoo.

Year: 2000

Theme: Impact and Influence of Donors in the Education Sector in Ghana.

Scope: The paper examines, reviews and makes a critique of the role of
                the donor community in the delivery of educational services and in
                influencing the performance of the education sector in Ghana over
                the past five years.

Initiator: The Ghana National Education Coalition Campaign (GNECC)

Findings:

- The impact of donor intervention has been positive and negative; but more negative in that funding of education has suffered a decline in real terms as a consequence of a constrained fiscal environment.
- Most donors took the view that beneficiaries of tertiary education should be made to bear a substantial portion of the cost. This view contrasts sharply with Article 25 of the 1992 Constitution, which requires that there must be progressive introduction of fee-free tertiary education.
- Some donors support debt cancellation but differ as to whether it would make any difference in terms of expanding access to social services such as education.
- Among donors, there is ignorance about NGO contributions to education or outright dismissiveness about their role in the sector.

Recommendations:

- Mechanisms for strict and fair monitoring of how proceeds of debt relief are used must be put in place. Management of such resources should involve the participation of civil society organisations to improve transparency and accountability.
- Decentralization is necessary if resources directed at the education sector are to be used efficiently and effectively.
- There is the need to strengthen the implementation capacity of the MOE/GES and put in place sustainable financing arrangements at all levels of the educational system.
- It is prudent to harness the efforts of NGOs in education.

Relevance: Direct relevance

(15)

Title:	University Rationalization Study, Volumes I and II.
Author:	Sutherland-Addy, Esi et al. (University Rationalization Committee)
Year:	1987/88
Sub-sector of Study:	Tertiary education
Scope of Study:	Countrywide
Initiator of Study:	Ministry of Education
Executing Body:	University Rationalization Committee
Objectives:	To provide basic information and recommendations for the formulation of a medium-term university sector development plan.

Findings:

- The student makes little contribution to the funding of his/her own education. This is believed to affect his/her attitude, taking education for granted.
- The mix of graduates is not properly balanced for national development since the graduates in the arts and humanities far outnumber those in science and technology.
- Training in non-university institutions, especially the polytechnics, is characterized by rigid commitment and adherence to British educational institutions, leading to non-relevance of course content and orientation. The problems of equivalency at the tertiary level point to the need for standardization.
- There is an absence of a coherently structured higher education system linked to other levels of education (basic and secondary). This is detrimental to the sustained and proper development of the country's human resources.

Recommendations:

- All pre-service training institutions run by the various departments and agencies of government should be brought under the authority of the Ministry of Education to ensure policy control. These institutions, together with the universities, should constitute the tertiary education system.
- Pre-service tertiary institutions in each region should be unified in a comprehensive college to be known as the Regional College of Applied Art, Science and Technology (RECAAST).

- All tertiary and potential tertiary institutions should adopt the semester system of academic year. The course-credit system with the institutions should be kept open all year round for full-time and part-time students and for vacation schools and evening classes.
- The institutions should go from being residential to being mainly non-residential and in support of this, they should abolish the dining hall system, replacing it with the cafeteria system.
- A National Council for Higher Education, a Board of Accreditation and a Joint Admissions and Matriculations Board for all tertiary institutions should be established.

Relevance: Direct

(16)

Title:	The Development of Technical and Vocational Education in Africa
Author:	International Project on Technical and Vocational Education
Year:	1996
Sub-sector:	All levels of the education sector.
Theme of study:	Technical and Vocational Education in Ghana with focus on Special Education.
Initiator of Study:	UNESCO

Objectives:
- To identify the major constraints relating to human resource development in the country.
- To identify the means of counteracting the major constraints relating to human resource development
- To access programmes/strategies for special education development in Ghana.

Findings:
- The study found that the lack of skilled personnel in certain areas of the economy and the surplus in other categories of skills is due partly to a decrease of employment in the formal sector and is the major problem relating to human resource development in Ghana.

- The study further revealed that the informal educational system emphasized the study of academic subjects without any preparation for a job. This situation failed to adequately serve the socio-economic needs of individuals and the country as a whole.

- Special education for the handicapped was seen as one of the important components of educational development in the country. This observation was based on the consideration that handicapped people have the same needs as other people to enable them to lead a fuller life.

Recommendations:
- Steps should be taken to restructure formal education and training in educational institutions from the first cycle to the tertiary level
- Non-formal education, comprising mainly adult literacy programmes and skills development programmes, should be given greater importance in the educational restructuring process.
- Informal training, comprising the apprenticeship system, extension services and education through the mass media, should be factored into the educational reform process.
- Special education for the handicapped should be factored into the educational restructuring process.

Relevance: Direct

(17)

Title:	Revitalizing Universities in Africa: Strategy and Guidelines
Authors:	Association of African Universities and The World Bank
Years of Study:	1996-1997
Time of Publication:	1997
Coverage:	University Education
Theme:	The Important Role Played by African Universities and Problems Confronting Them
Sub-Sector:	Tertiary Education
Type of Literature:	Policy Document
Initiator of Study:	The World Bank and The International Monetary Fund
Executing Body:	World Bank/IMF

Objectives:

- To revitalise African universities
- To initiate action to halt the negative trends in university education
- To draw up plans to provide university leaders and all other stakeholders with structures and practices that enhance their ability to analyse conditions
- To help university leaders and all other stakeholders to express a vision and formulate goals, and to persuade a campus community to promote the advancement of its institution in a clearly enunciated and systematically programmed manner.

Findings:

- Individual universities in Africa generally play a larger and more influential role in national development than do universities in other parts of the world. African universities frequently hold a near-monopoly on the production of skilled managers and technical specialists for the private and public sectors, generation of new local knowledge through research, linkage of the country to scientific world at large and the inculcation of professional values.
- In the medium term, the success of Africa's development efforts will be tied closely to the success of its universities.

Conclusion:

- The current challenge is not what to do by the universities but how to do it.
- University staff must seize the initiative through the process of strategic planning.

	• Governments are to recognise their universities as important national resources that can make significant developmental contributions and to participate seriously in these strategic planning processes.
	• Higher education should be a high priority for donors.
Recommendations:	Among other things, the paper recommended that African governments should:

- Provide funding with the objective of ensuring educational quality.
- Support university strategic planning.
- Encourage management autonomy and initiative.
- Take the necessary steps to create an enabling environment for the establishment of private tertiary education programmes.

Donor agencies should:

- Recognize the legitimacy of higher education as a development investment.
- Support university strategic planning by providing the inputs required for undertaking strategic planning.

The World Bank should, among other things:

- Recognize the development benefits that come from investment in higher education.
- Include support for university strategic planning in education sector projects.

Relevance:	Indirectly relevant.

(18)

Title:	Structural Adjustment and Educational Reforms in Ghana
Author:	Professor J.S. Djangmah
Year:	August 1998
Sub-sector:	Basic, Secondary, and Tertiary education
Theme:	The state of Ghana's education before and after the introduction of SAP vis-à-vis the education reforms
Initiator:	SAPRI
Executing body:	SAPRI
Type of literature:	Official report.
Objectives:	The main objectives were:

- To highlight the performance of Ghana's education sector since 1952
- To identify pressing problems that have plagued Ghana's education reforms
- To provide a framework in which SAPRI can confront the problems associated with the reforms.

Findings:

- The practice and content of education in Ghana before SAP have their genesis in the 1952 Accelerated Development Plan which was the first time an attempt was made to implement fee-free primary education for all. Economic decline in the late 60s, 70s, and 80s reversed many of the gains that had been achieved in education.
- The SAP and Economic Recovery Programme came with prescriptions to not only make education more vibrant and viable but also to recover some of the costs of providing education. However, there are several problems including the lack of trained teachers, inadequate supply of textbooks, poor supervision, low enrolment and high dropout rates.

Conclusions:

- Funding of education by government is inadequate. If it wants to reduce funding for education, it should reduce debt servicing.
- Donor funding has contributed a lot to education. SAPRI may wish to get involved in the selection of areas in education expenditure where donor funding may be more effective. The question of how to address the problem of low enrolment and high dropout rates in deprived rural communities is real. Cost sharing at tertiary level is a major issue that must be addressed.

Recommendations:

- The government should spend more than it is doing now on education.
- The Ghana National Association of Teachers (GNAT), which is a major participant in SAPRI, should address more vigorously the issue of teacher non-performance in rural communities.

- Policy at the basic level must concentrate on how to manage spending on teachers more efficiently so that more money will go into teaching and learning materials.

Relevance: Directly relevant.

(19)
Title: African Development Bank: African Development Fund

Authors: The ADB Group

Subsector: Non-formal and Formal education

Theme: Educational Development in Africa with respect to management, organization and planning, educational costs and financing of education.

Coverage: Education in general

Initiator: African Development Bank

Executing Body: ADB Group

Objectives: The main objectives of this paper include:
- To reflect more specifically on the African Development Bank Group's present and future role in the development of education in Africa
- To analyse and identify the Bank Group's role in the education sector by reviewing the relationship between education and development
- To formulate policies to address critical problems confronting education in Africa.

Findings:

- One of the dimensions of the problem of educational administration is the ambivalence in many African states between the logic of decentralised management and the pressure of centralised control.
- In further analysing the elements of managerial inadequacy in African educational administration and planning, two key problems involve the qualifications and training of administrators and planners, and the information base for education planning and administrative decision-making.
- The Bank considers it important to make its support available for the efforts of regional member states to address the problems of education management through technical assistance, support for studies and institutional build-up.

Conclusion:

In view of the inability of African government to manage and finance education properly, it is important for all stakeholders, particularly the financial institutions, to come to the aid of the education sector.

Recommendations:

- The Bank Group should move towards a more explicit policy for guiding its lending policies in the education sector for years to come.
- African governments should make education a top priority in development.
- Variables such as quality and internal efficiency, relevance, costs, management, organization and planning should be factored in when education is considered.

Relevance: Indirect.

SOCIOLOGY DEPARTMENT, UNIVERSITY OF CAPE COAST (UCC)/ STRUCTURAL ADJUSTMEN T PROGRAMME REVIEW INITIATIVE (SAPRI)

Interview schedule for the study on Structural Adjustment Programme (SAP) and Tertiary Education in Ghana (1983–1999)

Name of Institution/Organization:

University ……………………………………………………………….. [   ]
Polytechnic …………………………………………………………….... [   ]
Government ……………………………………………………………... [   ]
Development Partners/World Bank…………………………………… [   ]
Student Representative…………………………………………………... [   ]

Position/Schedule of Respondent in the Institution/Organization/Locality:………………………..

	First Visit	Second Visit	Third Visit
Date of Visit	/ 08 /2000	/ /2000	/ /2000
Time of Interview: Start	:	:	:
Time of Interview: Ended	:	:	:
Status of Interview:	Complete……….. 1 Incomplete ……... 2 Refused ………… 3 Travelled ……….. 4 Other……………. 5	Complete……….. 1 Incomplete ……... 2 Refused ………… 3 Travelled ……….. 4 Other……………. 5	Complete……….. 1 Incomplete ……... 2 Refused ………… 3 Travelled ……….. 4 Other……………. 5

Interviewed by:………………………………………………………….……………..
Note: Specific questions for categories of respondents

Respondent	Specific questions
Tertiary Institution Authorities	Q1-12, 15-21, 25, 29-54, 55-60, 61-63, 64-68, 69-72
Government	Q13, 14, 15-21, 25, 55-60, 61-63, 69-72
Development Partner	Q26-28, 55-60, 61-63, 69-72
Student Representative	Q20-24, 55-60, 69-72

Interviewer's Comments:

SECTION A: **ACCESS TO TERTIARY EDUCATION**

ATTENTION: TERTIARY INSTITUTION AUTHORITIES

No	Questions	Coding Categories							Skip to
Q1	Male/female application, admission, and enroll-ment records for the period between 1983-1999.	Session	a. Application		b. Admission		c. Enrolment		
			Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	
		1983/84							
		1984/85							
		1985/86							
		1986/87							
		1987/88							
		1988/89							
		1989/90							
		1990/91							
		1991/92							
		1992/93							
		1993/94							
		1994/95							
		1995/96							
		1996/97							
		1997/98							
		1998/99							
		1999/00							
		Total							
Q4	Male/female application, admission, and enroll-ment records for candidates with **any form of disability** between 1983-1999.	Session	a. Application		b. Admission		c. Enrolment		
			Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	
		1983/84							
		1984/85							
		1985/86							
		1986/87							
		1987/88							
		1988/89							
		1989/90							
		1990/91							
		1991/92							
		1992/93							
		1993/94							
		1994/95							
		1995/96							
		1996/97							
		1997/98							
		1998/99							
		1999/00							
		Total							

No	Question	Coding categories				Skip to
Q7	Is there any specific regional equity/balancing policy with regard to admission/enrolment?	No………………………………………… 0 Yes………………...………………… 1 Don't Know ………...……………… 99				→ Q9 → Q9
Q8	Number of applicants from educationally disadvantaged regions (Northern, Upper East, and Upper West)	Session	Northern	Upper East	Upper West	
		1983/84				
		1984/85				
		1985/86				
		1986/87				
		1987/88				
		1988/89				
		1989/90				
		1990/91				
		1991/92				
		1992/93				
		1993/94				
		1994/95				
		1995/96				
		1996/97				
		1997/98				
		1998/99				
		1999/00				
		Total				
Q9	Outline specific policies with regard to admission/enrolment	………………………………………… ………………………………………… ………………………………………… ………………………………………… …………………………………………				
Q10	Give reasons for the policies above	………………………………………… ………………………………………… ………………………………………… ………………………………………… …………………………………………				
	Suggest ways of increasing access to tertiary institutions.	………………………………………… ………………………………………… ………………………………………… …………………………………………				
	Suggest ways of increasing quality of tertiary education.	………………………………………… ………………………………………… ………………………………………… …………………………………………				
	ATTENTION: GOVERNMENT REPRESENTATIVES					
Q13	What are government policies with regard to admission/enrolment into tertiary institutions?	………………………………………… ………………………………………… ………………………………………… ………………………………………… No specific policy				→ Q15

| Q14 | Give reasons for the policies stated above. | ……………………………………………………
……………………………………………………
……………………………………………………
……………………………………………………
…………………………………………………… | |

SECTION B: BUDGET AND FUNDING

Attention: Tertiary Institutions Authorities and Government Representatives

	QUESTION	CODING CATEGORIES		SKIP TO
	What are the sources of funding open to your institution?	Sources	Percentage	
		Government		
		Internally generated (Institution /consultancy)		
		Bank Loan		
		Student Fees		
		Donations from philanthropic Organisations		
		Other (specify)		
	Outline constraints faced by your institution in mobilization of funds	………………………………………………… ………………………………………………… ………………………………………………… …………………………………………………		

Q17	Budget allocation to Tertiary Institutions (average over 5 yr period)	Item	1978-1983		1984-1989		1990-1994		1995-1999		
			¢	$	¢	$	¢	$	¢	$	
		Budget									
		Scholarship/ Bursary									
		Expenditure on residential facilities									
		Expenditure on laboratory facilities									
		Expenditure on classroom /teaching facilities									
		Library subscriptions									
		Expenditure on water and electricity									
		Expenditure on research									
Q18	Current percentage expenditure of budget on staff	a. Teaching Staff		b. Support staff							

Q19	How would you describe the expenditure patterns on Tertiary Institutions for the period (place tick-mark in appropriate box)?		1978-83	1984-89	1990-94	1995-99	
		More than adequate					
		Adequate					
		Inadequate					
		Don't know					

ATTENTION: TERTIARY INSTITUTION AUTHORITIES, STUDENTS REPRESENTATIVES AND GOVT. REPS.

Q20	Sources of **financial support for students** for the period (place tick marks in the appropriate box)	Sources	1978-83	1984-89	1990-94	1995-99	
		Government					
		SSNIT					
		Parent/Self					
		Tert. Institution					
		Foreign Agencies					
		Other (specify)					

Q21	How would you describe the **institution's financial support for students**? (After responding, Tertiary Institution Authorities and Govt. Reps **Go to Q 25**)		1978-83	1984-89	1990-94	1995-99	
		More than adequate					
		Adequate					
		Inadequate					
		Don't know					

Attention: Students Representative(s)

Q22	What is the average money available to a student per semester?	Below C500,000…………………………………………1 C500,000 – 750,000 ……………………………………… 2 C750,000 – 1,000,000 ……………………………….. 3 C1,000,000 and above …………………………………… 4	

Q23	Average current students expenditure on the following items, per semester.	Item	Amount in Cedis	Percentage	
		Feeding			
		Stationery			
		Books			
		Residence			
		Academic user facility			

Q24	How would you describe the **institutions financial support open to students** vis-à-vis the average expenditure of the student	More than adequate …………………………………….. 1 Adequate ……………………………………………... 2 Inadequate ………………………………………………… 3 No basis for comparison …………………………………… 4	

ATTENTION: TERTIARY INSTITUTION AUTHORITIES AND GOVT. REPRESENTATIVES

Q25	Specify the modalities for cost recovery of tertiary education	…………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………………	

SECTION C: VIEWS ON COST RECOVERY

	ATTENTION: Development Partners/World Bank		
Q26	State the stand of your institution on the current modalities of cost recovery of Tertiary Education	……………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………	
Q27	What Tertiary Education function(s) is/are being funded by your institution? (tick all applicable)	Research (pure) …………………………………………… 1 Research (applied) ………………………………………… 2 Scholarship to students …………………………………….. 3 Scholarship to teaching staff …………………………………. 4 Endowment …………………………………………………. 5 Building/physical development ………………………………. 6 Book acquisition ……………………………………………. 7 Book development …………………………………………… 8 Other (specify) …………………………………………….... 9	
Q28	Provide reason(s) for your answer to Q27 above.	……………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………..	

SECTION D: QUALITY OF TERTIARY EDUCATION

	ATTENTION: Tertiary Institution Authorities		
	Question	**Coding categories**	**Skip to**
Q29	What was your institution's lecturer /student ratio before SAP (1983)?	………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………	
Q30	What has been the lecturer/student ratio after SAP?	………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………	
Q31	Which is most cost-effective ratio before SAP or after SAP	Before SAP. …………………………………………………..1 After SAP. ……………………………………………… 2 No difference. ……………………………………………..... 3	
Q32	What is your assessment of the overall quality of education after SAP?	Significant improvement ……………………………………….. 1 Moderate improvement. …………………………………………2 No improvement ………………………………………………3 Deterioration …………………………………………………4	
Q33	Explain your answer to Q32.	………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………...	

Q34	What type of assistance do you receive from development partners? **(Circle all that apply)**	Research (pure) ……………………………………………… 1 Research (applied) …………………………………………… 2 Scholarship to students …………………………………….. 3 Scholarship to teaching staff ……………………………… 4 Endowment …………………………………………………… 5 Building/physical development …………………………… 6 Book acquisition …………………………………………… 7 Book development …………………………………………… 8 Other (specify) …………………………………………….... 9	
Q35	What is your assessment of the overall relations hip with development partners after SAP?	Satisfied ……………………………………………………… 1 Not satisfied ………………………………………………… 2 Indifferent …………………………………………………… 3	
Q36	Please give reasons for your answer to Q35	…………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………… ……………	
Q37	What type of assistance do you receive from NGO's?	Research (pure) ……………………………………………… 1 Research (applied) …………………………………………… 2 Scholarship to students …………………………………….. 3 Scholarship to teaching staff ……………………………… 4 Endowment …………………………………………………… 5 Building/physical development …………………………… 6 Book acquisition …………………………………………… 7 Book development …………………………………………… 8 Other (specify) …………………………………………….... 9	
Q38	What is your assessment of the overall relationship with NGOs after SAP?	Satisfied ……………………………………………………… 1 Not satisfied ………………………………………………… 2 Indifferent …………………………………………………… 3	
Q39	Please give reasons for your answer to Q38	…………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………………	

SECTION E: HUMAN RESOUCE DEVELOPMENT

ATTENTION: Tertiary Institution Authorities		
Q40	Have you introduced any market driven programmes since SAP?	Yes………………………………………………….…1 No ..…………………………………………………….2	Q45

Q41	Identify these programmes (fill the table accordingly).	Name of programme	Year introduced	Mode of funding	

Q42	What are the reasons for introducing the programme(s)? **(Circle all that apply)**	Means of self-financing ……………………………………… 1 Means of attracting students …………………………… 2 Means of justifying existing programmes ……………… 3 Recommendations from Govt. ………………………… 4 Recommendations from World Bank …………………….. 5 Recommendations from Linkage partner(s) …………… 6 Demand from industry ……………………………….. 7	

Q43	What are the prospects for these programmes?	……………………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………………	

Q44	What are the problems being faced in connection with the above programmes?	……………………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………………	

Q45	What types of training programmes does staff undertake?	Internal courses …………………………………………….. 1 External courses (foreign) …………………………………… 2 A combination of the two above …………………………….. 3 Other (specify)……………………………………………… 4	

Q46	Who covers the cost of training programmes?	Your institution ..……………………………………………… 1 Govt. of Ghana …………………………………………..… 2 Foreign assistance …………………………………….....… 3 Staff ……………………………………………………….. 4 Other (specify) …………………………………………...…… 5	

Q47	What are the **policies** of your institution towards **staff attraction**?	……………………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………………	

Q48	What are the **policies** of your institution towards **staff retention**?	……………………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………………	

Q49	What are the **policies** of your institution towards **staff promotion**?	……………………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………………	

Q50	What was the situation concerning academic **staff retention before SAP (1983)**?	....	
Q51	What was the situation concerning academic **staff promotion before SAP (1983)**?	....	
Q52	What are the mechanisms for quality control of academic staff?	....	
Q53	What are the mechanisms for quality control of support staff?	....	
Q54	What are the future plans of your institution in meeting the demands of the economy	....	

SECTION F: IMPLEMENTATION OF TERTIARY EDUCATION REFORMS

ATTENTION: Govt. Representatives, Tertiary Institution Authorities, Students and Devt. Partners			
Q55	What is your **assessment** of the **tertiary education reforms**?	Positive..1 Negative... 2 No impact.. 3	
Q56	What aspect(s) of the reforms have you found comfortable during the implementation?	Modification in the autonomy of tertiary institutions.........................1 Supervision of tertiary institutions by NCTE.................................2 Establishment of university colleges from existing diploma-awarding institutions...3 Establishment and maintenance of a university (UDS) in the north........4 Implementation of cost-sharing...5 Adjustment tertiary institution curricula to that of the new SSS system…6 Pursuance of distance education as an alternative mode of increasing access to tertiary education..7 Other (specify)...8	
Q57	What have been the constraints of the implementation of the reforms?	....	
Q58	What is your (institution's) position/programme for distance education?	Positive .... 1 Negative .... 2 Indifferent 3	

Q59	Give reasons for your answer to Q 58	………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………	
Q60	How much work has been done [what has been put in place concerning distance education]?	………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………	

ATTENTION: Development Partners/World Bank, Government, Tertiary Inst. Authorities

No	Question	Coding categories	Skip to
Q61	What reasons are there for the **financial cut-back on social services** in Ghana?	………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………………	
Q62	What is your assessment of such a policy on educational development in Ghana?	Very satisfactory……………………………………..1 Satisfactory……………………………………………2 Not satisfactory………………………………………3	
	What is your assessment on parents' ability to pay in support of tertiary education	Very capable……………………………………………1 Capable……………………………………………….2 Not capable……………………………………………..3	

SECTION G: INTERNATIONAL LINKAGE

Tertiary Institution Authorities			
Q64	How many international institutes are located within your institution?	No ……………………………………………. None…………………………………………………..0	Q69
Q65	How many of such international institutes were established since SAP?	No …………………………………………….	
Q66	Who finances these institutions?	International Org. (Specify) ………………………………… 1 Ghana Govt. ………………………………………………. 2 Ghana Govt. and International Org. ………………………... 3 Local Institution …………………………………………... 4 Other (specify) ……………………………………………… 5	
Q67	How much is the government of Ghana contributing?	………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………	
Q68	What benefit do(es) you (your institution) derive from the presence of the international institution(s)?	………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………… ………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………	

SECTION F: STRUCTURAL ADJUSTMENT PROGRAMME AND TERTIARY EDUCATION

Attention: All Respondents

Q69	Impact of SAP on the following areas of tertiary educatio n	Items	Positive impact	Negative impact	No concrete impact	Don't know	
		Access					
		Quality					
		Financing					
		Infrastructure development					
		Accommodation					
		Student's feeding					
		Student's loan					
		Research					
		Personnel (Academic)					
		Personnel (Support) Library facilities					
		Others					

Q70	What is your general assessment of the impact of SAP on tertiary education?	Positive …………………………………………………….. 1 Negative …………………………………………………… 2 No impact ………………………………………………… 3	

Q71	Give reasons for your answer to Q 70	…………………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………………… …………………………………………………………………… ……………………………………………………………………	

Q72	Which of the following conditions for World Bank assistance would you recommend for incorporating into future development of tertiary education	Condition	Recommendations			
			Strongly recomm ended	Recom mended	Not recom mended	Not at all recom mended
		Control of intake by Govt. Control of intake by Inst.				
		Limiting Tertiary's share in the education budget to 18%				
		Implement cost recovery mechanisms				
		Reduction of all staff to 30% of student population				
		Implement an acceptable student-loan scheme				
		Procurement of materials through international competition				

		Communities and other shareholders to contribute 10% of cost of tertiary education				
		Establishment of a mechanism for annual review of expenditure with IDAs (Government is to contribute 10% of cost).				

FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION TOPICS

SAP Knowledge and Assessment
    1.1   Knowledge of SAP
    1.2   General assessment of SAP
    1.3   Impact of SAP on social life of participants
    1.4   Impact of SAP on economic life of participants
    1.5   Evaluation of socio-economic life before and after introduction of SAP

Tertiary Education Knowledge and Assessment
    2.1 Knowledge about tertiary education: its types (university, polytechnic) and objectives.
    2.2   Access to tertiary education knowledge
    2.3   Gender access to tertiary education
    2.4   Disability to tertiary education
    2.5   Quality of tertiary education: - What it is? Assessment
    2.6   Relevance of tertiary education to the development of Ghana

Funding of Tertiary Education and SAP Impact

    3.1 Who funds tertiary education
    3.2 How tertiary education should be funded
    3.3 Parents and students role in financing of education
    3.4 Community/Assembly role in funding of tertiary education: - Ability to pay
    3.5 Impact of SAP on government's ability to finance tertiary education
    3.6 Impact of SAP on parents' ability to finance children's tertiary education
    3.7 Who to finance tertiary education – parent/government.
    3.8 Student's loan scheme – knowledge, adequacy, assessment
    3.9 Alternative funding for tertiary education

Tertiary Education Reforms

    4.1 Knowledge of reforms
    4.2 Relationship between reforms and SAP
    4.3 Impact of reforms on costs of education to:
        -   Parents
        -   Students
        -   Community
        -   Assembly
        -   Government
    4.4 Assessment of reforms by participants